GENDER DIFFERENCES IN MIGRATION OPPORTUNITIES, EDUCATIONAL CHOICES AND WELLBEING OUTCOMES

Nitya Rao

School of Development Studies
University of East Anglia

With support from
Munshi Israil Hossain, Lead Researcher, Bangladesh
Shrayana Bhattacharya, Research Support, India

March 2009

Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty
University of Sussex

C O N T E N T S

LIST OF TABLES
3

1. INTRODUCTION 4
Key Research Questions 4

2. METHODOLOGY AND STUDY SITES 5
The Bangladesh Setting 6
The Indian Setting 8

3. CONCEPTUAL IDEAS IN UNDERSTANDING GENDERED MIGRATION PATTERNS 10
Employment and Labour Mobility 12
Economic Security 14
Education and Inter-generational Mobility 17
Migration and Mobility 19

4. MAPPING MIGRATION PATTERNS FROM THE STUDY VILLAGES 23

5. THE MIGRATION EXPERIENCE 35
Reasons for Migration 35
The Process of Migration 37

6. EDUCATION AND MIGRATION LINKAGES 51
Educational Effect on Migration 51
Education and Social Networks 58
Investment in Education 59
Role of State Policies 59

7. CONCLUSION 62

REFERENCES 64

ANNEX 1: PROFILES OF RESPONDENTS OF IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS 68

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Main Activities of Population over 15 Years in Study Villages 23
Table 2: Land Ownership 24
Table 3: Educational Attainments (in percentages) 24
Table 4: Migrant Occupations 26
Table 5: Migrant Destinations 27
Table 6: Educational Profiles of Migrants 28
Table 7: Factors Contributing to the Probability of Migration (Personal Characteristics: Results of Probit Regressions 30
Table 7a: Definition of Variables 31
Table 7b: Variable Descriptive Statistics 31
Table 8: Village-level Differences in Migration Factors: Further Probit Regressions 32
Table 9: Social Security in Study Villages 33
Table 10: Reasons for Migration 35
Table 11a: Costs of Migration: Bangladesh Villages 37
Table 11b: Sources of Financing Migration – Achingaon 37
Table 12: How Jobs Are Secured 38
Table 13a: Problems Faced at Destination by Type of Migration: Bangladesh 42
Table 13b: Problems Faced at Destination by Migrants from Mahari, India 43
Table 14a: Amount of Remittances: India 44
Table 14b: Amount of Remittances: Bangladesh 45
Table 15a: Use of Remittances: Bangladesh Villages 46
Table 15b: Distribution of Consumer Goods 47
Table 16: Risks and Vulnerabilities Faced by Family Members at Origin: Achingaon 49
Table 17: Duration of Migration by Sex: Achingaon 50
Table 18: Effect of Years of Education on Migration 51
Table 19: Education and Occupation of Migrants in Bangladeshi Villages 53
Table 20: Education and Occupation in Bangladeshi Villages 53
Table 21: Education and Occupation of Migrants in Indian Villages 55

1. INTRODUCTION

This paper has emerged out of research conducted in two villages each in Bangladesh and Jharkhand state in India with support from the Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty. The main research aims were:

a) To identify the linkages between migration opportunities, both perceived and actual, and the educational decisions/choices of boys and girls on outcomes in terms of emigration, education, skill formation and work, in the context of globalisation.
b) To understand the perceived contribution of migration and mobility to enhancing earnings, and also to the building of social and symbolic capital and gendered identities.

Key Research Questions

1 What are the migration opportunities available to boys and girls in a context of globalisation? Where are these opportunities located – close to the locality, distant urban centre, or abroad?
2 To what extent do these migration choices reflect 'distress' and to what extent do they constitute an informed choice?
3 Have perceptions about migration and what it consists of changed over time?
4 What are the current aspirations of men and women in relation to migration opportunities?
5 How far do these provide an incentive or a disincentive to higher education outcomes for boys and girls?
6 How far are migrant remittances actually invested in improving educational outcomes?
7 In what ways do state structures and processes help or hinder female and male internal and international migration?
8 How far does the presence of a migrant (differentiated according to geographical location and duration of migration) contribute to altering social and gender relations, in terms of status and power, in a rural context?

2. METHODOLOGY AND STUDY SITES

This study was designed as a comparative study in Bangladesh and India[1]. In each country, two rural sites, with high rates of migration, were selected for the study using the following criteria:

a) variations in the rate of education (one site with relatively high literacy levels, the other with relatively low literacy levels, in each location) in order to capture the effects of education, both at the individual and social level, on migration opportunities, choices and representations
b) variations in terms of remoteness and communication in order to assess the impact, if any, of location on migration opportunities.

As part of the selection process, first of all, high and low literacy districts were identified in both Bangladesh and the Indian state of Jharkhand using national census data. Several villages in each district were shortlisted and then visited: the criterion used here was the existence of a secondary school in the village. The assumption was that secondary education carries the potential for opening up a range of alternative employment opportunities, which do not necessarily result from primary schooling. A high level of out-migration was a further criterion used for selection of the village to be studied in depth. Distance from the urban headquarters was initially considered, but found to be less significant in shaping people's choices; in fact, remote villages with less access to public services, information and transportation, tended to reveal a higher rather than lower level of migration, though perhaps to a limited number of destinations; as a result, the criterion of remoteness was dropped. The availability of local logistical support in carrying out the research was taken into account in the final selection of the rural sites.

The objective of conducting village studies was to develop a deeper understanding of the linkages between migration and education decisions for an individual located within a household and community structure to capture elements of social embeddedness, instead of focusing only on the migrant workers at the destination, or at the point of origin. Village studies helped us carry out interviews not just with migrant workers, but also with non-migrants, with both educated and uneducated individuals, in order to identify possible variations in their priorities, in terms of earnings, status and mobility considerations. An important point to note here is that while the Bangladeshi villages were relatively homogenous in terms of religion and ethnicity, this was not the case with the Indian sites. The main population group in both the Indian villages constituted of Scheduled Tribes (STs), seen as both marginal in relation to the mainstream Indian population, as well as less educated. Under the influence of Christian missionaries, one of the villages was doing well nonetheless in terms of education, but the label of STs in itself produces a different social dynamic, both within the locality and as perceived from outside.

Given the research objectives, a combination of methods was employed in order to achieve a more in-depth study. Having reviewed the relevant secondary literature and macro-level sectoral data where available, a short survey of all households was conducted in the selected villages in order to access basic household information (including religion, ethnicity and household size), with a specific focus on the educational, employment and, most importantly, migratory characteristics of all household members. Specific questions were asked about reasons for migrating, types of activities undertaken, and what assets were available at home

[1] Jharkhand state in India was selected owing to the doubling of the number of female domestic workers to Delhi from 0.019 million in 1983 to 0.047 million in 1999.

and which ones had been accumulated through migration. Questions relating to land and livestock holding, health status and social security provision were also asked. Who responded to the survey was not predetermined, but based on the availability and readiness of individuals – in most instances, couples responded jointly to the questions.

Based on this survey, 16 individuals were selected for in-depth interviews in each village giving consideration to their gender, educational level (primary/secondary) and migration status (migrant/non-migrant). Two interviews were conducted from each category (primary level migrant, primary level non-migrant, secondary level migrant and secondary level non-migrant), making for a total of 16 in-depth interviews (8 male and 8 female) in each village. The migrants were selected in accordance with their availability in the village at the time of the research, so that they could be interviewed directly. In some instances, this involved returning to the village at a more appropriate time. For instance, in one of the Indian villages, women domestic workers return home for the Christmas period, so part of the qualitative research was conducted over the Christmas holidays. The interviews explored various aspects of household decision-making, especially those that related to choosing to become a migrant, to experiences of migration, but also to the value of education in the local context.

In the case of one of the Bangladeshi villages, additional information on migration experiences, costs and remittances was available from a survey conducted in 2005 by Proshika's Impact Monitoring and Evaluation Cell (IMEC) as a follow-up to the ESRC-funded research on Wellbeing and Development conducted by the University of Bath. Permission was sought to analyse and use this survey data as part of the current research project. Similar data was not collected for the other three sites. In addition, case studies were conducted of specific migrant streams. This included migrant workers to the sugarcane fields of western Uttar Pradesh and to 'mini-Jharkhand' in Delhi in the case of India, and garment workers and overseas migrants in Bangladesh. Interviews were also conducted with garment factory owners in Dhaka as well as unions/associations of both garment and overseas migrant workers. While the case studies and in-depth interviews provide insights into the ways in which individuals and households make strategic choices, the village survey data helps to set the livelihood context of these locations whilst also throwing up interesting patterns in terms of migration destinations and experiences within and across sites. The sector-based interviews and secondary data helped to place these insights within a larger macro-economic framework of development and change (see also (Whitehead 2002) on the need to combine micro and macro, quantitative and qualitative research for effectively tracking livelihood change).

The names of the villages and people have been changed in order to ensure confidentiality.

The Bangladesh Setting

In Bangladesh, Comilla and Manikganj districts were selected for this study, the former with a much longer history of education than the latter[2]. Both report high levels of migration to Dhaka and to the Gulf countries. Achingaon in Manikganj has 310 households, all Bengali Muslims, living in eight *paras* (hamlets) consisting of different *bangshas* (lineage groups). A majority of villagers are engaged in agriculture (218), followed by small business (51), welding shops (30), overseas migration (31), Export Processing Zones (10), garment factories (5), and other activities such as rickshaw/van pulling, day labouring and teaching and religious work (Table 1). Despite the huge dependence on agriculture and agricultural labour, most of the interviews

[2] Comilla had a literacy rate of 45 per cent in 2001 (42 per cent female) as against Manikganj, which had a total literacy rate of 40 per cent and a female literacy rate of 35 per cent (Statistical Pocketbook Bangladesh 2004).

suggest that land seems to have lost value as both a source sustaining livelihoods and as a marker of status. In another study, based on an analysis of a panel dataset of 379 households, Sen (2003) too points out that the major impetus to growth for the 'ascending households' and 'never poor' come from the non-agricultural sectors especially trade, services and migration. Migration opportunities here mainly lie in the garment factories and welding workshops in the city, and in a range of unskilled labour tasks abroad. Gardner (2006) on the other hand demonstrates that young men, hoping to migrate to London, would never engage in agriculture, for reasons of status.

Achingaon has a primary school, two NGO-run non-formal primary schools, and two madrasas. Around 63 per cent of the children are in primary education, with 31 per cent going to the madrasa, 19 per cent to the government primary schools and 13 per cent to NGO-run schools. During the rainy season, most of these schools are under water and hence closed. The only provider of secondary education in the village is the Alia madrasa. The government high school is located in Suapur, a business centre about 1.5 kilometers away. Lack of adequate provision and poverty are two reasons why a majority here have not completed their secondary education, but not surprisingly, it is the madrasa that has produced a few male graduates, most of whom are now employed as teachers in madrasas or as imams of mosques (Table 3).

Five years ago there was no proper road in this village. With the help of the Union Chairman, a mud road has been constructed from Achingaon to Suapur. Approximately ten years ago an all-weather road was made between Suapur and Sreerampur, on the main highway to Dhaka. This has hugely improved connectivity and motivated people to move in larger numbers to Dhaka and other places in search of work. As Jamser[3] noted, 'Dhaka is now very near us because of the improved road communication. Earlier people were afraid of going to Dhaka; they had to start on foot or by boat early in the morning to reach there in the evening. It took a whole day; they mainly went for attending cases in the court. But now people can go to Dhaka in an hour and a half and return home the same day after completing their work.' The shift in the perception of distance and in turn attitudes to migration can be attributed, at least in this case, to improved transport and communications. Dhaka is no longer perceived as a distant place, an unknown to be feared, but as a source of opportunities and work. There is a small bazaar in the village, set up two years ago on the mosque's land, to make groceries available locally in the village, but the larger markets are in Suapur and Kalampur.

Sadara, a village in Daudkandi upazilla of Comilla district, about sixty kilometres from the district headquarters, has 174 households. They are grouped into 17 *baris* (bangshas or lineage groups), with 5-15 households in each. There are two bazaars in the village, one within the village, and a second one, newly set up on the metalled road connecting the village to the Dhaka-Chittagong highway. Easy road communication and low transport costs have perhaps made people shift their shops to the new location. In terms of occupations, apart from agriculture (68) and business (55), the number of white-collar workers in this village is noteworthy (Table 1). Almost 100 people (87 men and 13 women) have regular employment in government and non-government sectors both within the district and in other parts of Bangladesh. While several people have moved to Dhaka or overseas to the Middle-east (as in Achingaon), one also finds a few migrants to the east, including to Singapore and South Korea. Most of the latter can claim at least a secondary school education, but such migration additionally requires substantial financial resources.

[3] See Annex 1 for a full listing and profiles of all interviewees.

The village has a government primary school, a high school and two kindergarten schools. Reputed as a good school on account of its favourable public examination results, the secondary school completion rates are much better here than in Achingaon. Yet dropouts persist – boys seeking employment and girls for marriage. With lands remaining flooded for almost half the year, travel to school becomes difficult, especially for the younger children.

The Indian Setting

India being a vast country, the study was situated in Jharkhand state in eastern India. There were two main reasons for this selection. First, Jharkhand is among the top 10 states in India providing in-migrants to Delhi, and the third highest provider of female in-migrants in search of work into Delhi according to the 2001 Census. Secondly, due to prior work in Jharkhand, background material and logistical support were easier to obtain. Two districts were selected within the state – Simdega and Sahibganj – the first with a higher than average overall literacy rate (53 per cent, with 42 per cent female literacy) and the second amongst the lowest in the state (37 per cent overall literacy and 26 per cent female literacy, with only 3.5 per cent for ST women). The villages selected were Katona in Simdega and Mahari in Sahibganj. Both have high levels of out-migration. Scheduled Tribes constitute the majority of the population[4]. The ethnic composition appears to produce different migration dynamics as compared to the Bangladesh villages, as STs, while socially marginalised in India, have a reputation as good manual workers, making it difficult for them to graduate to other forms of work. This is particularly stark in the case of Mahari.

Katona is a small village with 112 households, 15 kilometres away from the district headquarters of Simdega. Two buses a day ply between Katona and Simdega. The population largely belongs to the Kharia and Oraon Scheduled Tribes, a majority of who are now Roman Catholic. This has implications for both education and employment, as most of the Roman Catholics are not just literate, but have also completed at least 8-10 years of schooling in the school run by the Holy Cross Sisters, located in the village. There are also several residential mission schools located at Samtoli in Simdega. The Roman Catholic Diocese was established in 1837 in Simdega and a major focus of its work has been education; in fact more than a third of high schools in the district are run by the mission (Tete 1986). Backward class Hindu groups form less than 20 per cent of the population of the village and their literacy rates are low.

While agriculture is the principal activity, over 75 per cent of agricultural households are also engaged in other activities – agricultural wage labour, work in brick-kilns or engagement with public works programmes. Migration has become crucial to local livelihoods, with almost 14 per cent of the population migrant (Table 1). While labour for both agriculture and construction form important migration streams (see also the work by Rogaly et al. 2000, Rao 2002), the aspiration for men is to join the armed forces or government employment for the high level of social security benefits they offer, or engage in factory work. For women, there are two possible streams –for domestic work in the major Indian metros including the capital city, Delhi or joining a religious order and training to become a nun. It is interesting to note that a range of religious orders visit the secondary school in the village to recruit girls – and this is not an unattractive option, particularly for girls from poor families, as they offer life-time security (16 girls are with different orders at present).

[4] Scheduled Tribes are a constitutional category that refers to indigenous and ethnic minority populations who were considered to be backward, and hence special provisions were made for their development.

Mahari village in Sahibganj district, six kilometres away from the main road at Borio (block headquarters) and 40 kilometres from the district headquarters, has 330 households: 176 Santal (ST), 94 Hindu (largely belonging to Other Backward Castes) and 60 Muslim. A large majority, especially of the Santals and Muslims, are illiterate; only about 3 per cent have completed secondary education. There is a government middle school in the village, but this is located in the Hindu hamlet. The village is cut through by a railway line laid by the National Thermal Power Corporation (NTPC) to carry coal from the Lalmatia mines to the main railhead at Pakur, an adjacent district. The Santal and Muslim hamlets are located on the other side of the railway track and this is perhaps one reason why few children from here attend the school. In 2005, the government set up smaller schools 'on demand' in these hamlets, under the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyaan or Education for All programme, but without proper infrastructure, attendance remains poor. The high school is located at Borio, and only a few boys from the village manage to continue their schooling there. Of those who have completed their secondary education, 10 per cent have done this from residential mission schools (Santals) and 8 per cent from madrasas (Muslims). Migration for education provided by religious institutions constitutes an important decision-making point in Mahari.

Occupations here are clearly divided by religion and ethnicity. Agriculture and wage labour dominate the occupational profile of the Santals, with the sub-group of Mahlis engaged in bamboo-work. The Muslims are primarily petty traders engaging with the livestock trade as well as umbrella repair, building, coal-trade etc. The Hindus are divided into two groups: the more educated are engaged in teaching, medicine or government jobs; and a large number of the others are engaged in trading coal. This is essentially an illegal activity – coal is clandestinely removed from the special coal train that passes through the village thrice a day; this is then taken to the local markets and sold for fuel. If caught, a fine has to be paid or the goods are confiscated. While the Hindus do not own much land, they are able to lease in the better land from the Santals. Yet productivity in general is low due to lack of irrigation and other infrastructure.

Several issues arise from this brief contextual description of the four study villages. Before exploring these in further detail, a few key conceptual issues are laid out next, which help understand the forms and meanings of gendered migration patterns in the different contexts.

3. CONCEPTUAL IDEAS IN UNDERSTANDING GENDERED MIGRATION PATTERNS

In this section I set out some of the theoretical discussions useful for understanding the motivations that drive people to make particular life choices, whether in terms of migration, other forms of employment or investment in education. Even though these social theories do not explicitly focus on gender differences, gender is implicit in an understanding of social stratification based on the differential valuations of roles, and their segregation.

There is considerable literature around migration as a strategy for livelihood diversification (de Haan 1999). The reasons vary from survival and the lack of other options to strategies of accumulation, both of material and symbolic wealth. Apart from economic security, people also aspire to social mobility and status enhancement. So while poverty is a major driver of migration in the selected locations (Mosse et al. 1999; Kothari 2002), the meanings and representations of migration too matter. These are gendered and vary both by place in terms of the destination of migration, but also by the type of employment/work undertaken, and its outcomes.

Understanding social organization and positioning owes a lot to Weberian ideas of class, status and power, linked respectively to the economic, social and politico-legal orders (Gerth and Mills [1948] 1997). Class is economically determined, linked to the ownership and control of property and relations of production. But what is interesting to note is the existence of possibilities for stratification or differentiation within classes too in line with the kinds of property, or goods and services that can be exchanged in the market. This is pertinent especially in the Indian study area, where while a majority of the STs are technically land-owners, they nevertheless occupy a subordinate class position in relation to the Hindus, who may or may not own landed property. This is where the idea of status appears to overshadow the idea of class, as property is not necessarily recognised as a status qualification; rather this is reflected through lifestyles and the social estimation of honour. While production then is a reflection of class, consumption becomes a reflection of status. Status as a lifestyle that includes a range of cultural practices such as dress, speech, bodily dispositions, tastes etc are central to Bourdieu's (1984) perspective on distinction, a way in which people organize their perception of social space. These ideas are analytically useful for recognizing the interconnections between the different pathways to gaining distinction or status – each individual's position depends on the structure of assets that he/she possesses, but also the social trajectory or mode of acquisition of these assets (age, education, father's occupation, income etc).

While acknowledging the interconnections, Turner (1988) also notes the autonomous existence of each of these factors and the difficulties in privileging one or the other in the process of changing social hierarchies or gaining distinction[5]. This is particularly visible in the Bangladesh study sites where a clear contradiction is visible between the emergence of consumption especially of consumer durables such as TVs and mobile phones as a result of migration and the persistence of traditional forms of ranking. In fact, the ownership of a TV can be considered not just a reflection of conspicuous consumption, but rather of demonstrating 'tastes' and contributing to distinction. The cultural system is clearly fragmented, with an explosion of consumer culture and a consequent erosion of status hierarchies as ranked categories, enabling people to move between different social positions. Appadurai (1996) sees these disjunctures as resulting from the emergence of a new 'global culture' consisting of several dimensions, which he describes as ethnoscapes (people involved in migration and physical

[5] Apart from culture/lifestyle and class/economy, political entitlements are central to Turner's analysis.

movement), mediascapes (electronic capabilities to widely produce and dissemination information, both fictional and realistic), technoscapes (movement of technology, both mechanical and informational across boundaries), financescapes (movement of global capital) and ideoscapes (sets of ideas woven into a political narrative. The interactions between these different *scapes* are dynamic and not easily predictable. So, while one might expect that exposure to new countries, new media and technology, will make people more liberal in their ideas, this is not necessarily the case; in fact in Bangladesh there is a growing conservatism in terms of religious practice and gender norms.

Before moving on to issues of mobility, it is worth making a brief comment on the issue of recognition and segregation of status groups. Apart from lifestyles and consumption, recognition as part of a particular status group is also related to employment chances, social intercourse and marriage. Physical labour, for instance, is often seen as 'degrading'. At the same time, as evident from Bangladesh, there is an effort by families to find potential bridegrooms who show aspirations to move towards self-employment on the one hand or to migrate overseas. As I demonstrate later, while a majority of these bridegrooms did engage in manual labour tasks overseas, they sought to set up businesses once they returned home. They needed to accumulate sufficient capital for this purpose but demands on them from kin and family for arranging visas, marriages and performing social ceremonies were also high, resulting in a large number remaining migrant for at least five years or more (Afsar, Yunus, Shamsul Islam 2002, Siddiqui and Abrar 2002).

In the Indian study, ethnicity/caste becomes an additional variable used for status segregation, guaranteed by ritual notions of purity and impurity rather than law or even material differences. Here, in addition to the other elements, a vertical hierarchy of social domination and subordination is created in relation to one's ethnic/caste identity. For negatively privileged groups like the STs in India, their dignity is related to the future rather than the present. Political action is one way of making resource claims (Chatterjee 2004), and migration offers a route out of existing social hierarchies.

Following from this brief discussion of social organization, migration appears to play a critical role in terms of its potential for changing the dynamics of interaction between class, status and power. Overseas migration from the Bangladesh villages is a very good example of this process in action. By shifting the geographical site of the performance of work, migration invisibilises the possibly degrading character of this work. The narratives of people's experiences emphasize a sense of 'newness' and of 'smartness' essential for survival in a foreign land, rather than a discourse of hard work (Piketty 1995). Geographical mobility here connotes possession of certain key life skills, including the ability to negotiate and survive in unknown contexts. Additionally, by enhancing economic returns, it facilitates investment in and maintenance of a different, largely consumption-oriented lifestyle. Older forms of cultural capital as reflected in higher education and artistic tastes get replaced by other forms of distinction -- for instance, contribution to the local mosque, or owning a mobile phone that could be shared with others in need.

At the same time, migration trajectories are contextual and do not always have such positive outcomes in terms of status enhancement. In one of the Indian study sites, migration is seasonal, less secure and perceived to be a result of desperation or distress. The earnings contribute to household survival rather than enhancing consumption in any substantial way. The aspiration here is to give up migration, or drastically change the quality of migration, and this becomes possible only through an investment in education or drawing on some of the older

notions of cultural capital. Access to white-collar, clerical work is here a marker of status, but with growing numbers of educated youth, this often remains an unfulfilled dream (Jeffrey, Jeffery and Jeffery 2004). Here one sees a much greater movement towards collective political action for accessing privilege, as the weight of social structures continue to pose major barriers to individual mobility.

While migration does open the possibilities for changing roles and activities, for developing new skills and experiences, the gendered valuations do not necessarily change. The stream of migrant women domestic workers in India is a good illustration of this. While economically their domestic work is now valued, as it receives a wage, it continues to be socially devalued. While it is essential for the daily reproduction of all households, when performed for a wage, it is seen as degrading work, linked to notions of dirt and impurity. Rather than contributing to consumption or status enhancement, the gendered nature of asset ownership and the social trajectories of their acquisition sometimes lead to the opposite for women. For example, women's migration appears to enhance their personal confidence and sense of autonomy more than anything else. But this is perceived as a threat to the existing patriarchal social order and efforts are then made to control women's autonomy. This contradiction is clearly visible in the range of strategies used by the families of women garment workers in Bangladesh to control their autonomy and sexuality. Status for the family is seen to lie in this restriction rather than enhancement of women's mobility.

I turn now to an examination of the arenas of employment and labour mobility as well as consumption and social mobility in a little more detail before moving on to an analysis of the field data.

Employment and Labour Mobility

Globalization has broken many barriers, especially in terms of the explosion of consumer cultures, no longer a preserve of the few but accessible to people from a range of social classes and statuses. The organization of labour too has moved towards increasing flexibilisation, characterized by informal or semi-formal employment relations, rather than more secure forms of employment (Mitter 1994). Yet labour markets continue to be segmented, both by gender and by caste/ethnicity, especially at the lower ends of unskilled or semi-skilled work. The nature of work, and its classification as being 'degrading' or 'respectable', influences its uptake by particular social groups or categories. So, for instance, while SCs/STs continue to dominate agricultural labour work in India, it is the upper caste Hindus who form a majority of regular (white-collar) workers, and Muslims dominate the realm of trade (Sachar 2007: 93). It is this segregation that has created a huge demand for migrant agricultural labour in the more progressive agricultural states of northern India, as local groups, aspiring to status improvement, are no longer willing to perform these tasks. One therefore finds large-scale seasonal migration of workers, especially from the economically more backward regions of Bihar, Jharkhand, Eastern Uttar Pradesh and Rajasthan to other parts of the country for undertaking manual work. The 2001 census estimates that almost a sixth of the Indian population is on the move! When returns are likely to be substantially higher, there appears to be scope for flexibility in these valuations of work, as observed in the case of overseas migrants from Bangladesh.

Whether the migration is internal or international, at the lower end, most jobs are secured through referrals from social networks, rather than individual merit or skill. There has been considerable discussion around the strength or weakness of social ties (Granovetter 1973) and

their contribution to both the migration process and its outcomes. While networks do provide valuable information and thereby reduce the risks of migration, as I illustrate later, they also imply obligations, especially in a kin/caste-based society. They pose limits on individual mobility by creating a pressure for downward leveling, thus also contributing to the reproduction of social norms rather than their transformation (Munshi and Rosenzweig 2003). The important point to note here is that the migration decision is not purely an individual one – even if the initiative is individual, it is located within the livelihood strategies of the household and its membership within a particular community. An exception perhaps is the growing tendency for young girls, oppressed by domestic work burdens at home, to run away to the capital city, as in India, in search of work. These decisions may be individual, but they too are socially embedded, and represent an attempt to break out of restrictive social norms and gain a sense of freedom and identity (Shah 2006). Yet such migration often turns out not to be a positive experience, at least in material terms. The social embeddedness of individuals thus brings with it both opportunities and responsibilities. While migration carries within it a sense of new place and a new experience, with potential for transforming gender relations, the migrant's embeddedness in strong social networks can also limit its transformative power by reinforcing obligations to the family and group (Portes and Sensenbrenner 1993). Contradictions are thus thrown up by the migration process, and final outcomes depend on a process of negotiation and compromise between the individual and the larger social context.

Networks are not benign, nor are they equally accessible to different people and groups. Social groups, closer to each other in the social hierarchy, are likely to have greater affinity to support each other than those with a greater social distance between them, who would in fact attempt to oppose the accumulation and economic mobility of the 'lower-ranked' groups. An example is Mahari village in India, which has a mixed population of Hindus, Muslims and Santals (Scheduled Tribes). The Hindus, generally better off economically and higher in the social hierarchy, prefer not to migrate, but rather take up salaried jobs or business ventures in the locality. They are only prepared to migrate for high status jobs, such as in the government. Their social interaction with both the Santals and Muslims is mainly as clients for their services (tuitions, health provision etc), rather than as facilitating agents. The Santal population here, while owning land, is poorer than the Hindu population, and seasonally migrates for manual work in agriculture and construction. The Muslims, while also educationally backward, prefer not to engage in agricultural work and are largely petty businessmen. They also take on the role of agents for migrant labour, as they are often better travelled than the Santals. Interestingly, while Muslims lag behind other social groups in terms of literacy rates or even work participation rates, they do better than the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, especially the latter[6]. Hence, while they do network with the STs and help them in the migration process, being low down in the social hierarchy themselves, such migration does not really contribute to substantial social or economic mobility. Iversen (2006) finds a similar pattern of networks between castes close to each other in the hierarchy in his Karnataka study.

The second Indian village, Katona, provides a sharp contrast. Under the influence of Christian missionaries, most of the Scheduled Tribe people here are educated. The Church organizations further support them with skill training. They hence seek non-manual jobs -- in the army (for men) or in the government sector or other white-collar occupations (such as teaching and nursing for women). Of course these jobs are relatively few and far between, and

[6] While all-India literacy levels were 65 per cent in 2001, this was 59 per cent for the Muslims and 52 per cent for the SC/ST categories. For Jharkhand, the gap is higher with Muslims at 55.6 per cent and SC/ST at 39.7 per cent. Interestingly, here Muslims fall slightly higher than the state average of 53.6 per cent (it being an ST dominated state) (Sachar, 2007).

while this does lead to considerable frustration in terms of unmet aspirations, with nothing to do at home, young people do migrate in search of a better future. Men seek factory jobs in Delhi and women often take up domestic work. While socially not considered 'respectable', both these options help them earn and save more money than they would locally, contributing at least to improved material lifestyles. Over a period of time, maintaining such a lifestyle could also lead to enhanced social status. Community and neighbourhood networks do play a role, especially in securing accommodation in Delhi for the boys, and jobs in the factories, yet a major source of both information and support, especially for women, is the church and its related organizations, providing such migrants relative freedom from their kinship obligations.

In Achingaon, the poorer Bangladesh village, girls and boys both migrate to the garment factories, and boys also to the welding workshops. The wages at both these are higher than those paid locally, and as such they are able to contribute to earnings. But these again are seen as low status jobs, which people with higher levels of education would not engage in. Such jobs in factories are mainly accessed with the support of relatives (Table 12), who might put in a recommendation to the factory manager. In Sadara, like Katona, the networks are much more diverse. While the extended family does play a role, agents do too, in addition to people making their own contacts through NGOs or other organizations.

Luke, Munshi and Rosenzweig (2003) point out that education can lead to less dependence on networks, as it provides people information and contacts that can enable them to find new and different opportunities. A reduced dependence on networks can also reduce their obligations to kin and caste group, an observation that partly holds true for Katona. In their Mumbai study, they found that a large number of boys and girls studying in English medium schools were also able to marry out of their caste in comparison to those studying in Marathi-medium schools. The latter were tied in to their networks for accessing blue-collar jobs. Contrary to this, Gardner (2006) finds that marriage remains an important channel not just for making and cementing social networks, but also assuring Sylheti boys access to the United Kingdom and opportunities there. In Achingaon, one of the Bangladesh study villages, the focus on expanding networks and opportunities through marriage was clearly visible, and despite considerable difficulties for the daughter, parents of a girl preferred to marry her to an overseas migrant. And with the import of Islamic, conservative gender values from the Middle East, parents also appear to prefer a madrasa education for their daughter rather than a secular and possibly higher quality education. In fact, the existence of such networks can be a disincentive to the pursuit of higher education, a point made also by Mckenzie and Rapoport (2007) in the case of Mexico[7] and Corbett (2005) for fishing communities in Canada.

What needs to be kept in mind is that while individuals do exercise agency, they are also embedded in systems of social relations that do reflect differences in relative power. While networks of personal relations may largely work positively, especially for the poor, they can also become constraining and exercise a downward pressure. Yet people make choices and investments, including in education, in consideration of their own social context at a particular point in time (Granovetter 1985). This issue of educational mobility and social networks is discussed in greater detail in the last part of this paper.

Economic Security

A second aspect of migration, and perhaps a motivation for migration, is the idea of relative

[7] They find that migration and the existence of dense migrant networks has a negative effect on schooling, especially of boys in the 16-18 age group.

deprivation, rather than poverty per se. There has been considerable research to explore the poverty-migration linkages (de Haan 1999; Sabates-Wheeler, Sabates and Castaldo 2005), but no clear picture emerges on who migrates and for what reasons. Mosse et al (1999) have tried to classify different migration streams by the class/poverty level of the migrant, clearly bringing out the linkages between starting resources, which includes both financial and material resources as well as social ties, and outcomes. But the picture appears to be more complex. Even for the poor, while poverty and material circumstances are clearly a push factor, the migration decision is tied into certain personal and/or familial aspirations as well. The idea of relative deprivation helps capture this aspect, as people often compare and contrast their own lifestyles with those at the points of destination. The continuities and discontinuities involved in the idea of relative deprivation also relate to Appadurai's notion of ethnoscapes, a new landscape of aspirations and practices constructed from people's experiences of movement. In the Jharkhand villages, people had constructed an image of Delhi based on interactions with migrants. As Manto said, 'I had heard that it is a really nice city. But when I landed in Delhi, the station was big and I was initially scared. I had my relative's address and luckily a *pan wala* helped me take a bus to Mehrauli, and then I felt better'. Sheila commented, 'I have not seen the city, but I have heard that everything there is big and bright. A boy from this village works in a big hotel there, he seems to earn well, as he helps his poor mother and family live a good life… it must be a good place for people.'

While poverty and obligation to the family is no doubt one reason, migration is also driven by other factors: the desire to have nice clothes, to have access to modern gadgets such as televisions, as well as the desire to escape from burdens of unrecognized domestic work at home. Consumption patterns of the large cities are an aspiration for many in rural contexts today, and seen as non-achievable if one continues to live and work in rural areas, at least in the South Asian context.[8] Migration then becomes an important pathway for fulfilling at least a part of this aspiration. For women in particular, the idea of autonomy and the control over sexuality experienced in their migrant lives, in addition to consumerism, motivates them to stay on as migrants, despite miserable working conditions in a large majority of cases. While traditionally, and even today, education and the white-collar jobs this opens access to are seen as the major channels for acquiring status distinction in India, modernization processes have opened up other channels in competition with schooling, one such being consumption. Hashim (2005) and Oni (1988) reach a similar conclusion in the case of Ghana and Nigeria respectively. In Bangladesh too many young men prefer apprenticeship to formal education, as working in a welding shop to learn the skill, for instance, is often the first step to migration overseas, to the Middle East. And this carries with it returns that are material, and that substantially enhance status through consumption.

Consumption has often been viewed as repressive, as a tool for the exploitation of poor countries by the rich, as being opposed to the interests of labour. In market-driven politics in particular, all action is viewed as consumption choice. No attention is paid to the relative access to resources that make choices illusory or real, whether this is monetary or educational capital (Miller 1995). Individual rationality is seen to prevail, rather than a consideration of consumption as a social, cultural and moral project. If one takes account of the imperatives behind consumption and its experiential aspects, then it emerges as more than just functional;

[8] Work from Latin America on the concept of 'new rurality' is however much more dynamic in seeing the possibility of two way migration processes, from rural to urban, and urban to rural, as being able to equally fulfill one's aspirations for status (Farah (2007). This is also a result of the development of infrastructure and services in rural areas reducing the gaps in basic amenities between the urban and rural unlike much of South Asia. One of the Indian villages in fact lacks electricity, piped drinking water, or any form of transport.

it carries elements of creativity, but more importantly, represents alternate ways of enhancing one's social position. It means more than the purchase of goods. It has an intimate place in value creation, in its concern with state services and in addressing not just resource access, but issues of status and exclusion. While consumption is a marker of social inequality, it can also be a symbol of social success, a route to social mobility. Its progressive potential lies in its recognition of the creative power of diverse groups to consume in different ways, rather than homogenising the pathways of mobility. It can also be more empowering, especially in a context of global production, wherein a person is placed within large systems of production over which he/she has little control. To quote Miller (1995: 42): 'There is a clear preference for consumers to be able autonomously to employ their resources for the self-construction of their individual and social identity, rendering their place in work as no more than a necessary constraint created by their obligation to earn a living.' As already mentioned, this strategy is visible in the narratives in particular of male overseas migrants, who focus on their earnings and consumption, rather than offering up details of the nature of the work they do. As I discuss later, it also reflects the failure of the state to provide good quality educational and health services.

While control over money and consumption appear to be key elements in the formation of a new class or social identity, for women the symbolism this carries differs from that for men. In a study of domestic technologies, Sonia Livingstone (see Lunt 1995) found considerable difference in the ways in which domestic goods are construed, especially in terms of constructs of necessity, control, functionality and sociality. Women tended to see domestic technologies as a lifeline, a necessity, rather than a luxury. While men often spoke of objects as substitutes for social interaction, women saw these as facilitators of social interaction (ibid.). Mobile phones form an example in the Bangladesh context -- men saw it as a means to give and receive information, while for women it was a way of maintaining personal and social contact with the husband as well as other people.

There is also a difference in the representation of women's contribution to consumption. While women workers in the garment factories in Bangladesh, for instance, contribute both money and gifts to their households, their individual activity is socially constructed as short-term and temporary. It is ideologically subordinated to their role in the long-term reproduction of the household and community through the making of appropriate marriage alliances (Parry and Bloch 1989). It is interesting to note that women generally migrate for shorter periods than men in Achingaon (Table 17). This is not accidental, but reflects a strategy to prevent women from pursuing individual acquisition as an end in itself; developing a career in the industry and perhaps ultimately breaking off from her networks through marrying a man of her choice in the city where she works. So while women working outside the home seem to be a key element of the globalizing order, there are attempts to rework the notions of domesticity, reconciling public employment with the performance of domestic duties (Sen and Stivens 1998).

Women's work and contribution to consumption, is thus constructed as a short-term strategy, undertaken on account of poverty and leading to accumulation for a dowry that would enable a 'good marriage'. As Jackson (2005: 125) hypothesizes, 'Marriage works as a safety net for women in many contexts, as a form of insurance, but should women's enterprises threaten to outstrip husbands' incomes it becomes an impediment to accumulation.' Given the weak provisioning of social security in most of South Asia, it is not surprising that women in the study sites, especially in Bangladesh, see marriage as the ultimate form of future security rather than a career. Marriage, especially to a man with some resources, affirms their right as women to material support, provision and protection. It is not surprising then that parents seek to invest in

potential bridegrooms with a view to maximize life chances for their daughters. Of course there is a price to pay, and this is often linked to gender ideologies of subordination, such as control over mobility, though here too there is room to manouevre, deriving both from the context of the husband's absence and the need to make ends meet and the exercise of women's agency. The Indian example does not quite fit this model, given the specificity of Scheduled Tribes and the general acceptance of women's economic participation as a legitimate activity amongst them. Women therefore can pursue strategies of individual accumulation and opt out of marriage if they so desire, whether as domestic workers in Delhi or as nuns across the country. Despite this, marriage continues to be an aspiration for the majority, pointing to the value of marriage and cooperation, not just in material terms, but also in offering respectability and status.

Education and Inter-generational Mobility

While it is true that poverty is transferred across generations, and so are assets, making it difficult for the poor to strike out, especially within a competitive market, there are economic and social opportunities too. Recent research in the UK reveals that inter-generational mobility has fallen markedly over time, with there being less mobility for a cohort of people born in 1970 compared to a cohort born in 1958. Part of the reason has been the growing correlation between family income and educational attainment in these cohorts which, while leading to a narrowing gap across income categories at high school level, led to widening inequality in access to higher education (Blanden, Glegg and Manchin 2005). From a sociological perspective too, it appears that differences in current levels of income as well as in economic security and prospects for promotion, contribute to the shaping of aspirations and goals, both educational and occupational, of young people. It is hence often the case that children from less advantaged backgrounds opt for vocational rather than academic courses, as apart from carrying higher risks of failure, the latter may not be best suited for achieving upward mobility, as in the case of Bangladeshi youth in Dhaka's welding workshops mentioned above (Erikson and Goldthorp 2002).

In India, there is the additional complicating factor of caste/ethnicity. While this can be advantageous in some respects, for instance, by making particular labour markets the near-exclusive preserve of one or the other caste/ethnic group, these usually tend to be at the bottom of the ladder – with tasks which no one else will do. The one area where inter-generational change can occur is in terms of human capabilities as developed through education. Higher levels of education potentially can lead to both economic security and social status for households that start relatively poor. While success stories do exist, the numbers are small. Given the general low quality of education, any educational success requires substantial additional investment, which may not always be possible for a poor household with inadequate financial resources. Even if this is managed, the next hurdle comes in securing suitable jobs, those with long-term security, benefits and prospects. Almost all the educated Santals in Mahari, though few in number, mentioned that merit was no longer an adequate criterion for securing a job – large amounts of money were required to pay bribes – and this they lacked (Jeffrey, Jeffery and Jeffery 2004). Recent economic research demonstrates that wealth, race and schooling are all important for the transmission of economic status across generations. Policies for racial/caste equality and for promoting educational achievement among the deprived can be put in place, yet these are easier stated than accomplished (Bowles, Gintis and Groves 2005).

Schooling in fact can contribute to reproducing social and gender inequalities and status

hierarchies by justifying privilege and attributing poverty to personal failure (Longwe 1988; 1998). It ends up translating social privilege into personal merit and social disadvantage into personal deficiency. Children from poorer and working class families, from lower castes and tribes, consistently underachieve at every level of the educational system compared to middle and upper class children. The reasons are several: lack of state investment in schools attended by a majority of poor children (and rural schools), issues of language, demeaning attitudes of teachers, low expectations on the part of the children, an irrelevant and biased curriculum, as well as poor health and poverty itself (Kumar 1993). Furthermore these children grow up in environments where there appears to be little hope for mobility, hence there is a tendency to rebel against the system rather than conform to it (Willis 1977; Balagopalan 2005).

Yet, in most of South Asia, it is still regular salaried jobs that are seen to contribute to both economic security and social mobility. These however are dependent on the skills of workers, often measured in terms of educational credentials. The secondary school certificate is seen as a minimum qualification for most white-collar jobs. While this is an aspiration, few rural boys and girls, in India or Bangladesh, actually manage to complete their secondary school. The dropouts post-primary are very high. While net enrollment in secondary education was 45 per cent in Bangladesh in 2005, only half of these students, both boys and girls, survived the entire cycle, making for a completion rate of less than 20 per cent overall (Ahmed et al. 2007). In India too the situation is not much better. A little less than 30 per cent of all children enrolled drop out of the primary cycle, and this is over 40 per cent for ST children. At the upper primary level, 50 per cent of children enrolled drop out before completion; the figure is 65 per cent for ST children. The dominant reasons are the performance of domestic chores for rural girls and the need to work and contribute to the household income for boys, both rural and urban (Govinda and Bandyopadhyay 2007).

Inter-generational mobility also has a gendered dimension, and this is most clearly visible in household decision-making around education and schooling (Curran 1996; Foster and Rosenzweig 2002). While an investment in education is often seen in terms of potential future returns and wellbeing outcomes, this decision is not taken in isolation. It is related to the total household livelihood strategy and the household's immediate wellbeing and possible need for a child's labour. It is also related to the perceived ability of a particular child, access to quality education and the costs of acquiring a decent education. In such a context, not all children are selected for education, or even if they are, the type of schooling they get is likely to vary. As Estudillo, Quisumbing and Otsuka (2001) note in their study of land and schooling in the Philippines, with a growing masculinisation of the land economy, parents preferred to give more land to their sons, but more education to their daughters, with a view to equalizing their life-chances.

South Asia presents the opposite picture, with men continuing to be perceived as bread-winners and hence seen as worthy of educational investments. Yet, with the growing possibilities for female employment in globalised industries and services, and with girls viewed as better remitters than boys, this bias too is shifting. While a few families in Achingaon have moved to towns to provide better education for their children, given the nature of the labour market, the focus appears to be on acquiring the cheaper madrasa education. This is deemed sufficient for work in factories, and is further seen to facilitate migration overseas for boys, and is desirable for marriage to overseas migrants for girls (the ability to recite the Quran). Rather than past migration leading necessarily to greater investment in schooling, it appears that present schooling choices are linked to expectations of migration in the future.

Migration and Mobility

While in some ways it appears that economic mobility can be achieved through migration and employment, social mobility is additionally intertwined not just with material wealth, but also with educational level, the symbolic value of particular jobs, and regional effects, and all these are linked closely to the gender, age and marital status of the migrant. Due to high levels of stigma, married women are least likely to migrate, and if they do migrate, it reflects a high degree of distress.

Manual labour and domestic work, while no doubt valuable sources of employment, are perceived as low status activities within the local social hierarchies. White-collar work requires educational qualifications, and as mentioned above, these are hardly achieved. In the absence of educational credentials, new strategies are being created to make for economic and social mobility. For instance, a narrative is created around migration, especially by men, which may differ from the reality of the experience. Detailed interviews revealed this particularly to be the case with overseas migration from Bangladesh. While migrants often worked for close to 16 hours a day, with no benefits, they rarely communicated the difficulties of their lives overseas to their families. The loneliness of the migrant was spoken about, but not his poor working conditions, or even the type of job he was engaged in. This is perhaps one reason that in the Bangladesh data a large number of migrants are listed as white-collar workers – in their absence their families could not really say what sort of task they were engaged in[9]. The discourse here is increasingly around freedom and autonomy, with migration seen as a strategy to accumulate money to set up a business in the future. Such autonomy is seen to lie in self-employment rather than in different forms of paid work, with the exception of course of salaried public employment. Even though overseas migration largely involves manual labour, it has a higher status than manual labour in the locality as it brings higher returns (migrants often return home with consumer durables bought out of their wages). This migration is also represented as an adventure to a new land, which only 'smart' people can cope with. Smartness is here separated from formal educational credentials – it is linked to life skills, the ability to survive and make good in a foreign land. This migration stream has a religious dimension too; working in Saudi Arabia is seen to enhance the chances of performing the haj – a journey to Mecca – which immediately enhances social status. A haji, or person who has performed the haj, is respected as a learned and blessed person, irrespective of his or her literacy levels. Thus overseas migration, relative to the same occupation locally, enhances the status of the migrant, both in terms of income and experience. It does not, however, provide the same status to women, as first, they mostly engage in domestic work, perceived as 'unclean'; second, their incomes are lower than that of male migrants, and finally, their migration is seen as a result of dire circumstances and reflects the lack of capability on the part of the men in the family to provide, and is thus a loss of status for the household.

Success in such migration however is not a given -- it depends on a range of factors, which include not just skills and knowledge, and some financial resources for initiating the migration process, but also access to reliable social networks, people who can even provide food and shelter if required, not just a referral to a job. It is tempered not just by individual characteristics, but more importantly by the social-structural context. Thus, despite attempts to gain an education, Santals in the Indian study continue to be employed mainly as seasonal agricultural workers, barely receiving a minimum wage as payment. Such employment is both materially insecure and low status; the aspiration then is to stop migrating and develop more

[9] According to official statistics from BMET, less than 4 per cent were white-collar workers and close to two-thirds were unskilled or semi-skilled workers (Afsar et al. 2002)

sustainable livelihoods locally. Unlike in Bangladesh, parents of daughters here aspire to find a groom who has sufficient land for cultivation and need not engage in migration. The meanings of migration and the experiences differ with context, and an understanding of the processes involved can provide insights into the choices and investments that households make in the pursuit of migration strategies, or in alternate forms of livelihoods.

Before concluding this section, I would like to make a brief comment on globalization and the segmentation of the labour market at the more macro-level, rather than just the study villages. I have already demonstrated that the agricultural labour market in India is segmented by caste and ethnicity, with the SCs/STs dominating this stream. But this segmentation additionally is gendered. To exemplify, while Jharkhand is ranked eighth overall in terms of in-migrants into Delhi in 2001, it ranked fourth in the case of women. While nationally women's labour force participation rates have remained stubbornly flat from 1983 to 2000, there is a sharp increase in 2004-5, especially for women with below primary levels of education in urban areas. The National Sample Survey 61st round figures also reveal a sharp increase in regular salaried employment, especially for women, constituted of low paid jobs in schools and hospitals or as domestic help in households (Unni and Raveendran 2007). While estimates of domestic workers in India vary from 15 to 20 million, over 90 per cent of this workforce consists of women (GOI 2002). Not only is the domestic labour market expanding, a reflection of growing inequalities in class, wealth and status, with urban middle class women securing the help of poorer women to reproduce their lifestyle and social status (Chin 1998), but it is feminised, thus reproducing traditional gender divisions of labour, and increasingly dominated by particular ethnic groups. While the Scheduled Castes are seen as polluting within the caste hierarchy and therefore rarely gain employment in domestic work, except for undertaking the 'polluting tasks' such as cleaning toilets and collecting waste, the Scheduled Tribes lie outside caste. Seen as primitive, they are also constructed as being simple and trustworthy. Over the last decade kin chain migration and village chain migration has also contributed to the rapid growth of tribal domestic workers in the major metropolitan cities of India.

Rather than flexibility, segmentation seems to be on the rise, visible also in the two major growth sectors in Bangladesh. First, the readymade garment industry, which has grown rapidly in Bangladesh over the last decade, its contribution to local export earnings increasing from 32.35 per cent ($624 million) in 1989-90 to 78.17 per cent ($5686 million) in 2003-4. Almost two million women workers are employed, constituting 70 per cent of the workforce of the garment industry, though concentrated in the categories of temporary and casual workers (Mahmud 2001). In fact Bangladesh's global advantage lies in its almost unlimited supply of cheap and trainable female labour. The second major migrant stream consists of overseas migrants, who numbered close to three million and contributed USD 3 billion to net earnings from remittances in 1999-2000 (Siddiqui 2003). Figures from the Bangladesh Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET) reveal that more than 60 per cent of these are unskilled workers, the numbers growing steadily in the last decade. It is only very recently that there seems to also be an upturn in the numbers of skilled migrants. Close to half the overseas migrants have gone to Saudi Arabia, and this migration stream is almost exclusively male. In fact, following a few incidents of sexual harassment, the government had banned female overseas migration and this was only lifted in 2002, following the establishment of the Ministry (personal communication from Tasneem Siddiqui, 24 March 2007, Dhaka). So while globalization of labour processes has indeed opened up new employment opportunities and made the world a more mobile place, deeper analysis reveals that the opportunities available remain segregated by gender, class and ethnicity. Also, while education does play a role in terms of enabling one to change status positions, this relationship is no longer very clear or distinct.

While the four villages in this study reveal different livelihood trajectories, different levels of educational investments and attainments and different processes of migration, they do point out that without the support of the state, both in terms of an element of regulation and social support policies, radical social change is not possible. While migration provides the migrants with ideas, information and some income, it does not help them transform unequal social structures. Working conditions and wage structures remain harsh, whether it is in the export-oriented garment industry in Bangladesh, with the state unwilling to regulate in order to maintain and further attract capital investment, or the domestic work sector in India, which remains unregulated and unorganized.

Overseas migration presents a somewhat different picture in Bangladesh, as even though the country largely exports unskilled manpower, their remittances are substantial, more so than of skilled people, who are also more likely to settle down permanently in the country of they emigrate to. Bangladesh established a Ministry of Expatriates Welfare and Overseas Employment (MEWOE) in 2001, and in 2004 a Policy on Overseas Employment was adopted. The Ministry has two divisions, BMET and BOESA, for training and recruitment respectively. There is also an association of over 700 private recruiting agencies (BAIRA), also regulated by the Ministry. Detailed records of migrant workers are maintained in order to protect their interests. Easier and more convenient procedures for remitting money through official channels are also being established. Despite the minimal budgets, loopholes, and the persistence of cheating of workers by agents, existence of a state regulatory and support system can and does make a difference in at least ensuring minimum rights (RMMRU 2002). Interestingly, there was a major strike by garment workers in May-June 2006, seeking some regulation to ensure their rights. As trade unions were banned, there was no other way in which the workers could express their demands for an increase in wages, reduction of working hours, weekly holidays, maternity leave, conveyance etc (Mukta 2006). Ultimately an agreement was reached between the government, the employers (represented by the BGMEA and BKMEA) and the workers that promised to enhance the minimum wage, provide identity cards and a weekly holiday, regulate working hours, provide maternity leave and double the wages for overtime work. Karmojibi Nari, a workers' organisation, conducted a study in August 2006 to assess how far the agreement had been implemented. While the working environment seemed to have improved marginally, there still much to be desired (ibid: 8).

In India too, the National Domestic Workers' Movement has been struggling for over a decade to secure protective legislation both in terms of working conditions and social security, and a bill to this effect has been on the anvil for the last three years -- it has yet to be approved by Parliament. The same is the situation with agricultural workers, who continue to be largely unorganized, and despite the existence of agricultural minimum wages in all Indian states, the reality is of widespread non-payment (Chavan and Bedamatta 2006). They constitute a majority of the 'poor and vulnerable', those with a per capita daily consumption of no more than Rs 20 (25 pence) in 2004-05 (NCEUS 2007). India has had a law to regulate inter-state migration since 1979, but it has been poorly implemented, perhaps due to the largely seasonal and short-term migration undertaken by the poor.

What then emerges is that those with good resources to start with, whether in terms of financial, educational, or just by virtue of birth into the right caste/ethnic group, are always likely to be ahead in a competitive market economy, and able to make more lucrative migration choices. The most insecure, seasonal, temporary and manual jobs are left to the poorest and usually less educated migrant workers, often women, but also belonging to particular caste

groups. Gains from such migration are limited. Change however is possible if the state is able to ensure some minimum levels of accountability, equity and actualization of rights, whether through social protection or other promotional and regulatory actions. As already mentioned, while laws and policies to promote equitable education, for instance, do exist, these are not straightforward in terms of implementation and require a shift in concern and perspective in favour of the disadvantaged.

In the next sections I turn to exploring the following themes that examine migration as a socially embedded process:

a) Segmentation of the labour market and migration possibilities: mapping the migration processes by the type of work, destination, individual characteristics of the migrant, as well as elements of poverty and structural factors that could constrain their choice;
b) Role of networks in the experience of migration, including the ability to remit money and determine its usage;
c) Perceptions and aspirations for social mobility and gaining distinction within the local context, which would include an understanding of educational investments and choices in relation to migration, as well as shifts in consumption patterns as a route to inter-generational change; and
d) The role of state policies in facilitating or hindering the process and experience of migration.

4. MAPPING MIGRATION PATTERNS FROM THE STUDY VILLAGES

Before exploring specific migration patterns, Table 1 summarises the occupational profiles in the selected villages for the population over 15 years of age, disaggregated by gender. A few interesting points of contrast emerge. First, the Bangladesh villages show much lower levels of engagement with agriculture than the Indian villages and a much higher engagement with trade, especially for men. This is possible to understand if read alongside the data on land ownership presented in Table 2 below which shows that a majority of people are landless or marginal land-owners in Bangladesh, hence are forced to look for alternate occupations.

Table 1: Main Activities of Population over 15 Years in Study Villages

Main Occupations	Achingaon			Sadara			Mahari			Katona		
	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
Agriculture and allied	142 (32)	1 (.25)	143 (18)	67 (20)	0	67 (10.5)	188 (35)	78 (16)	266 (26)	103 (48)	74 (32)	177 (40)
Artisans	15 (3)	1 (.25)	16 (2)	17 (5)	0	17 (2.5)	26 (5)	60 (12)	86 (8)	2 (1)	2 (1)	4 (1)
Trade/commerce	40 (9)	0	40 (5)	55 (16)	0	55 (8.5)	49 (9)	2 (0.5)	51 (5)	6 (3)	1 (0.5)	7 (1.5)
Agric and Non-agricultural rural labour	73 (16.5)	2 (0.5)	75 (9)	10 (3)	1 (0.5)	11 (1.5)	100 (19)	98 (20)	198 (19.5)	48 (22.5)	53 (23)	75 (17)
Factory workers	42 (9.5)	9 (2.5)	51 (6.5)	0	5 (1.75)	5 (1)	20 (4)	0	20 (2)	12 (5.5)	0	12 (2.5)
Transport workers	24 (5.5)	0	24 (3)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
White-collar workers	13 (3)	2 (0.5)	15 (2)	90 (26.5)	13 (4.5)	103 (16.5)	20 (4)	5 (1)	25 (2.5)	24 (11)	8 (3.5)	27 (6)
Religious workers	11 (2.5)	0	11 (1.5)	-	-	-	-	-	-	3 (1.5)	6 (2.5)	9 (2)
Domestic workers	0	2 (.5)	0	-	-	-	0	10 (2)	10 (1)	1 (0.5)	19 (8)	20 (4.5)
Home-workers	2 (.5)	316 (85.5)	318 (39.5)	0	223 (76.5)	223 (35.5)	8 (1.5)	72 (14.5)	80 (8)	0	48 (21)	48 (11)
In education	34 (8)	25 (7)	59 (7)	35 (10)	31 (10.5)	66 (10.5)	5 (1)	0	5 (0.5)	12 (5.5)	13 (5.5)	25 (5.5)
Others not in labour force	20 (4.5)	7 (2)	27 (3)	66 (19.5)	18 (6.25)	84 (13.5)	7 (1.5)	4 (1)	11 (1)	2 (3)	8 (3.5)	10 (2)
Not answered	26 (6)	3 (1)	29 (3.5)	-	-	-	107 (20)	165 (35.5)	272 (26.5)	-	-	-
Migrants*	118 (27)	12 (3)	130 (16)	94 (28)	3 (1)	97 (15)	97 (18)	15 (3)	112 (11)	63 (29.5)	42 (18)	105 (23.5)
Total population	442	368	810	340	291	631	530	494	1024	213	232	445

Figures in brackets are percentages
Migrants constitute an overlapping category.

In Achingaon, the alternative occupations include a number of forms of non-agricultural work, including work in the factories and transport sector as well as self-employment. Sadara, which has an advantage in terms of better access to educational facilities, especially at the secondary level (Table 3), reveals a greater relative degree of diversification into both salaried work and self-employment. Apart from this reality of landlessness, cultivation is here also perceived to be 'hard work'. With 'poor returns', it is unable to fulfill livelihood needs, or contribute to status enhancement, hence people aspire to move into other occupations. With a very few exceptions, a majority of those engaged in agriculture are either illiterate or educated up to the primary level. One of the village women in Achingaon said: 'I have heard from my husband that

he went to primary school but did not pass any class. He works most of the time on other's land as a day labourer as we have no arable land. We have now leased in 20 decimals of arable land from a neighbour. But this is hard work, so sometimes he drives a van locally' (Rahela, 36, female, illiterate, housewife). In the Indian villages, on the contrary, land ownership and cultivation at least of the mainstay paddy crop in the monsoon is an essential element of tribal male identity. Most of the landless here are Hindus and Muslims; they are, however, not necessarily poorer.

Table 2: Land Ownership

	Achingaon	Sadara	Mahari	Katona
Landless	7 (2)	9 (5.5)	9 (3)	--
Less than 1 acre	108 (35)	56 (32)	49 (15)	19 (17)
1-2 acres	43 (14)	10 (6)	60 (18)	46 (41)
2-5 acres	7 (2)	4 (2)	52 (16)	41 (37)
Over 5 acres	2 (1)	1 (0.5)	17 (5)	6 (5)
No answer	143 (46)	94 (54)	143 (43)	-
Total households	310	174	330	112

Figures in brackets are percentages

Secondly, in the Bangladesh villages, there is a much larger proportion of population that is listed as home-workers. This primarily reflects the contrast in women's work between the two sites. Women in the Bangladesh villages are largely restricted to their homes and homesteads, even though engaged in a considerable level of productive work within their homes, in particular post-harvest processing and storage of crops, while Scheduled Tribe women in the Indian villages are economically active in the public sphere, both in agriculture and manual work. The pressure on men to 'provide' is hence much higher in the Bangladesh villages, and given the difficulties of finding suitable jobs locally, especially for men with higher education, migration is often the only option.

Table 3: Educational Attainments (in percentage)

	Achingaon			Sadara			Mahari			Katona		
	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
Illiterate	35	45	39.4	10	22	15	59.3	73.5	66.3	36	45	41
Primary	39	35	37.0	34	32	33	21.2	17	19.3	22.4	21.5	22
Junior Secondary	8	11	9.6	23	25	24	8	5.5	6.8	12.7	9.5	11
Secondary	6	6.7	6.4	18	13	16	6.5	3	4.8	15.5	11	13.3
Higher	12	2.3	7.5*	15	8	12	5	1	3.1	13.4	12	12.7
Total	473	564	1037	413	349	762	938	843	1781	321	316	637

75 per cent of these have completed hefzo (higher secondary level) from madrasas.

While a substantial proportion of the over-15 population is composed of current students in three of the sites, Mahari emerges as a stark contrast, a reflection on the poor educational provision in the village, and consequently the large numbers engaged in agricultural and non-agricultural labour. While women still constitute the majority of the illiterates in all four sites, and girls and women in general appear to attain lower levels of education than men/boys, the trends at higher levels appear to be moving towards parity. It is only Mahari that has persistent gender gaps right through the schooling cycle. With poor access to schooling in the village post-primary, it is interesting to note that both the Hindus and Muslims, when possible, send

their boys to a town, to stay with relatives or then in a madrasa, in order to secure a better education. As Kulesh observed, 'There are no schools actually operational in the Santal area. The Muslim school is falling apart. The building of the middle school has become better, but nothing has changed in terms of the attitude and dedication of the teachers.' Salim, a 33-year-old migrant, who is now also a labour recruiting agent for a farmer in Shamli noted, 'We have applied for our son to study at St Xavier's in Sahibganj. We are told it is a very good school and felt that it would be best if our son studies there. It is expensive, but I am only earning and saving for the children.' A few of the Santals are trying to send their children to missionary schools, but most of them do not have sufficient resources to pay for the costs of such education, which would include boarding facilities.

Even in a backward and remote village such as Achingaon, we find marginally more girls than boys studying up to the secondary level – perhaps an indicator of the success of the government's secondary school stipend programme. But there is a sharp fall thereafter -- clearly secondary is seen as enough for girls, and in a poor village in particular, parents are not willing to invest in girls' higher education. There are issues of access too. The girls largely study in the alia madrasa located in the village, recognized as equivalent to secondary schooling by the state. The quality may be poorer, but it is local and cheaper for the students than the general high school. Secondly, madrasa education is seen to make the students religious-minded, and particularly for girls, knowledge of and ability to read the Quran is seen as essential for making a good marriage (Aftabuddin 2006).

The migrant population comprises more than 15 percent of the total population in the study villages (over 25 per cent for the male population). Some are seasonal migrants and others more permanent. Mahari has a large number of seasonal labour migrants, almost exclusively Santals (with a few Muslims), a majority of who are engaged in agriculture (specifically sugarcane-cutting in western Uttar Pradesh) and other forms of manual labour (construction of roads in the border areas). Migrant work therefore is bodily very taxing, and several of them choose to migrate only every alternate year (Table 4). They usually migrate around September-October, after completing their own cultivation (as most of the Santals own land due to protective land tenure legislation), returning the following year in the month of May. Agriculture in the Indian villages still remains a primary occupation for a majority of the Scheduled Tribes, but with little investment, only one monsoon crop of paddy is possible, which is barely sufficient for survival. Migration here is seen very much as a survival strategy (or distress migration), with the Santals forced to migrate in order to survive during the agricultural lean season. A large number of migrants in Mahari who have not responded in relation to occupation are likely to be either agricultural or factory workers. At the time of the survey, they were not in the village and their family members were not able to say exactly what work they were doing.

Being educated and the ones with capital Hindus have been able to access much more land for cultivation by taking land as interest for loans given to the Santals. They therefore engage in cultivation and in salaried jobs, and interestingly, prefer to stay in the village rather than migrate. For those with higher levels of education, especially men, if they do have to migrate, they prefer to work in factories or small businesses, if white-collar jobs are unavailable, rather than work in agriculture or construction. There is also a caste/religion factor here, with Hindu castes (except for the Scheduled Castes) and also Muslims preferring non-manual work, either in sectors such as teaching and tutoring or in a range of self-employment and petty business activities. For the women here, high levels of illiteracy has meant that independent migration for domestic work is only just taking off, as in the cities, domestic workers are expected to at least be literate. From Katona, the more educated of the two villages, several men have entered the

army, and some have become pastors and priests. There are several nuns amongst the migrant women, while others have migrated for domestic work.

Table 4: Migrant Occupations

	Achingaon		Sadara		Mahari		Katona	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
Agriculture	12 (10)	-	6 (6.5)	-	42 (43)	6 (40)	22 (35)	2 (5)
Manual labour	40 (34)	-	50 (53)	-	15 (15.5)	-	12 (19)	3 (7)
Domestic work	-	2 (17)	-	-	-	9 (60)	1 (1.5)	19 (45)
Factory work	36 (30.5)	10 (83)	15 (16)	2 (67)	11 (11.5)	-	7 (11)	-
White collar work	30 (25.5)	-	23 (24.5)	1 (33)	3 (3)	-	21(33.5)	18 (43)
No answer	-	-	-	-	26 (27)	-	-	-
Total	118 (100)	12 (100)	94(100)	3 (100)	97(100)	15(100)	63(100)	42(100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

In Bangladesh, especially Achingaon, factory work is a major source of employment for migrant workers, both men and women, in welding and garments respectively. Interestingly, in the Indian study, work in the export-oriented factories in and around Delhi is still confined to men. The category of labour in the Bangladesh villages is almost exclusively male and includes overseas migrants; there are not many working in agriculture. The other major sector is white collar work, which while in Sadara includes a diversity of professions, from teaching and medicine to working with NGOs, in Achingaon it mainly refers to religious workers: teachers in madrasas and imams in mosques.

White-collar work potentially provides opportunities for women. In Katona, of the 18 working women, 14 are engaged in work within religious institutions as nuns and four are in government jobs. In Bangladesh too, especially Sadara, there are several women working as teachers or with NGOs based in the village itself. This reflects a larger point: in a rural context, the returns to women's education in terms of being able to access a secure, salaried job, once they have completed their secondary education, are much higher than for men. Perhaps this is because of the still small number of women who have completed their secondary education in these sites.[10] So it is relatively easier for educated rural women to find jobs locally and not have to migrate. In fact, migration at this stage is mediated by their marriage, rather than careers. As Sheila of Mahari reminisced, 'I wanted to complete my BA and take up work as a nurse. My sister had supported my entire education, but at this point she fell ill and could no longer support my studies, so my parents decided to get me married. I had made several job applications and in fact was asked to join for training, but this letter arrived after I was married. I could not go. Only Santal girls from here move for work; for us Hindus it is not considered proper. Only recently have I got a job locally as a *balwadi*[11] teacher. All these days I just stayed at home and looked after my children.'

Table 5 profiles the destinations of the migrants from the study villages. What is interesting to note is that rural-rural migration still forms an important source of livelihood within India due in part to regional development disparities within the country. A large part of the migration stream,

[10] Das and Desai (2003) reach a similar conclusion in relation to SC women in rural India – the returns to education for them are higher than for SC men.

[11] A pre-school for 3-6-year-olds.

as already mentioned, is for agricultural labour in northern India (the Green Revolution belt of western Uttar Pradesh and Punjab), or for construction.

Table 5: Migrant Destinations

Destination	Achingaon			Sadara			Mahari			Katona		
	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
Rural-urban	52 (44)	10 (83)	62 (48)	17 (18)	-	17 (17.5)	31 (32)	-	31 (28)	21 (33)	17 (40)	38 (36)
Rural-rural	-	-	-	-	-	-	45 (46)	6 (40)	51 (45)	30 (48)	5 (12.5)	35 (33)
Rural-capital city	37 (31)	-	37 28)	49 (52)	1 (33.3)	50 (51.5)	21 (22)	9 (60)	30 (27)	12 (19)	19 (45)	31 (30)
Middle East	28 (24)	2 (17)	30 (23)	21 (22)	1 (33.3)	22 (22.5)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Developed countries	1 (1)	-	1 (1)	7 (8)	1 (33.3)	8 (8.5)	-	-	-	-	1 (2.5)	1 (1)
Total	118	12	130	94	3	97	97	15	112	63	42	105

Figures in brackets are percentages

In Bangladesh, a large proportion of migration is either to Dhaka, the capital city, or other large towns, or then overseas to the Middle East. Overseas migration is virtually unknown in the Jharkhand villages – only one woman, a nun with the Missionaries of Charity, is currently in Poland. Data suggest that apart from the garment factories, several men are working in welding and other workshops too. For example, Anowar has been working in a refrigerator shop for seven years, visiting home for festivals or when required. If money is needed at home, his father comes to the workshop to collect some.

What is clear from Tables 4 and 5 is a segmentation of the migrant labour market, strongly gendered, on the one hand, but also imbuing different destinations with different meanings. While women are involved in agriculture locally, it is mainly men who constitute the migrant agricultural labour force in the study sites. In the Indian sites, especially Mahari, this is a bit of an unusual finding, as Santal women tend to dominate the seasonal migrant labour stream to the neighbouring state of West Bengal for transplanting and harvesting paddy (Rao 2002). Perhaps it is Mahari's location, close to Sahebganj and the rail link to Northern India, that has led to a flow of male labour to the sugarcane fields of western Uttar Pradesh in preference to the movement of female labour to West Bengal. Again migrant labour for construction and other manual work are essentially men, migrating to the northern states and the border areas in India and in the case of Bangladesh, largely overseas to the Middle East. There is a hierarchy in overseas migration too; it is closely linked to social status and social mobility. In the case of Sadara, there is a shift away from labour migration to the Middle East towards the more developed countries of East Asia. Nevertheless, rather than the activity/nature of work per se, overseas migration is seen to lead to social mobility for the successful migrants through alternate channels, particularly through consumption and the acquisition of the lifestyles of the urban middle classes (Mills 1999; de Neve 2004; Gardner and Ahmed 2006). Kabibur from Sadara migrated to South Korea and lived there for eight years. After three years, he took his wife too, and they both worked in a plywood factory. Their earnings were substantial and today they are perhaps the most well off couple in the village – they have bought land, built a house, and furnished it with a range of consumer products. The capital city, be it Dhaka or Delhi, does provide substantial employment opportunities, spread across a range of skills and educational requirements. So while people from Sadara and Katona, both more literate villages in their

particular contexts, attempt to secure more skilled work, in business, engineering or technical jobs, others come here in search of a range of manual and casual work.

Table 6: Educational Profiles of Migrants

	Achingaon		Sadara		Mahari		Katona	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
Illiterate	--		5 (5.5)	-	49 (50)	14 (93)	16 (25)	13 (31)
Primary	44 (47.5)	6 (54.5)	26 (28)	2 (67)	25 (26)	1 (7)	15 (24)	7 (17)
Junior Secondary	17 (18)	3 (27.5)	19 (20)	-	10 (10.5)	-	7 (11)	4 (9)
Secondary	13 (14)	1 (9)	23 (24.5)	1 (33)	9 (9.5)	-	13 (21)	16 (38)
Higher	19 (20.5)	1 (9)	21 (22)	-	4 (4)	-	12 (19)	2 (5)
Total	93	11	94	3	97	15	63	42

Figures in brackets are percentages

If one looks at the educational profile of migrant workers in Table 6 above, it is clear that while migrants from Mahari are clustered at lower educational levels (and largely involved in agricultural labour), in Katona and in the two Bangladesh villages they are more evenly distributed across educational levels. While those with primary education are more likely to be concentrated in labouring jobs, the dropouts from secondary school are more likely to be rural non-farm workers, engaged in welding shops, factories, or as transport workers. Over 30 men from Achingaon are engaged in welding work, some with primary and others with junior secondary education. Most of them are young, willing to work over 15 hours a day, in the hope that this will give them a ticket abroad eventually. In Sadara, such people prefer to engage in some form of business or self-employment, as they find shop-floor work leading to a loss of autonomy and status. In Katona, while the men are largely in factory work, the army or other forms of white-collar work, the women are either domestic workers or salaried workers in religious and secular institutions.

Katona provides an interesting insight into the cultural and social constructions of gender in a context where education, in this case secondary school education, is more accessible. An entirely tribal village, with women also seen as workers and not just reproducers, both boys and girls tend to get equal opportunities within the constraints of poverty and resource scarcity. Girls and boys here study at par with each other even till higher levels of education. The secondary school in Katona is run by missionaries. The majority of the tribals are Christian, and there is a lot of emphasis on education for itself. It is only here that men and women both seem to be engaged in services, even though for men the major option is the army and for women either teaching or becoming a nun. Several Christian religious orders come to recruit girls during their final year of secondary education. The new recruits are provided specialized training for a few years in their area of interest, which could be teaching, nursing, or a range of other welfare activities. Sister Helen, the principal of the secondary school, belongs to the local area. She trained as a teacher and has had placements in different parts of Jharkhand. This is the first time that she is located close to her home village.

Before moving on in the next section to the reasons for migration, the experience of migration and the outcomes of the process, the results of a probit regression are presented that sought to

capture the various factors that contribute to the probability of migration based on the survey data from Bangladesh (which covers the entire population of the two villages studied)[12]. While the first set of regressions focus on capturing personal characteristics in terms of marital status, educational level and type of activity, the second set of regressions seek to capture possible village-level differences through the use of village-interaction variables. The dependent variable (migration) is discreet and dichotomous, so either a person migrates or does not do so. The coefficients presented in Tables 7 and 8 tell us about the direction of the effect of the variables on the probability that someone migrates, rather than the magnitude of this effect. As revealed by the Chi 2 test, the results are significant, and the variables do contribute to explaining the probability of migration.

Several insights can be drawn from these tables. First, in terms of personal characteristics, being female and being married reduces the probability of migration. This fits well with ascribed notions of masculinity and femininity, with the protection and provision for women in their homes by the husband being a symbol of successful masculinity. For educated women too, finding a good husband is an important priority, a strategy for improving their future wellbeing, and hence a reason for investing in education, not just the search for employment. Jahanara appears to be an exception, though even in her case, while she was able to negotiate keeping on her job, this was possible on account of her marrying a man resident in the village where she worked. Her father was poor, but she was a bright student, got a scholarship in grade 5 and was able to complete secondary schooling from Sadara in 1982. She said, 'The teachers praised me very much as a good student. But as my father's financial condition was bad, I took this job with ICDDRB even before I finished my SSC. Sadara is not my own village, and I was living with a relative here. I then got married to Shafiq in this village. When I joined this job I got 750 taka per month. Now I am getting 12000 taka per month, so my husband engages only in part-time business, helping me when required'.

[12] As all data for India were not available in time, regressions have not been run for the India part of the study. For Bangladesh, the data set included 1,200 observations from Achingaon and 907 for Sadara. However there are missing observations for some variables included in the regression. Therefore depending on each regression there are around 1,600 observations in each.

Table 7: Factors Contributing to Probability of Migration (Personal Characteristics): Results of Probit Regressions[13]

	Coef Reg 1	Coef Reg2
Constant	-4.646984*	-4.96911*
Age_yt1	.2529519*	.2660777*
Age_2	-.0035498*	-1.267298*
Female	-1.385527*	-1.267298*
Married	-.6578103*	-.6239445*
separated	-.161812	.170112
agric	-.9958348*	
profess	1.791872*	
expend	-.000029*	-.0000235**
Loan	-.4376018	-.526239**
hsaving	-.0690547	-.3129359
socsec	-.729602**	-.5613265
Achingaon	.8090515*	.3077774*
Primary3		.4526108**
junsec3		.4497566**
secondary3		.4421277**
Highered3		.5778439*
Land	.0220167	-.1054332

* Variable is significant with 95 per cent confidence.
** Variable is significant with 90 per cent confidence.

Number of obs = 1619

Regression 1: The variable single (or unmarried) forms the base category and thus is not included in the regression. This acts as a reference variable and each other marital status category is compared to this one. In terms of occupations, non-agricultural (other) work is used as a base category.

Regression 2: Marital status is the same as in regression 1. An educational variable is included wherein illiteracy is the base category.

Further, while the probability of migrating increases up to a certain age, there is a decline thereafter. This is not only true of women, who drop out of the migration stream after marriage, but also for men, who aspire to have a settled family life eventually. In terms of activities, salaried work substantially enhances the probability of migration, while those engaged in agriculture are less likely to migrate, though land ownership itself does not reveal any significant relationship with the probability of migration. The comparison here is in relation to non-agricultural jobs. In terms of educational levels, there is no marked significance for the probability of migration except for those with higher education. The location and its livelihood context are much more significant: people from Achingaon are more likely to migrate than those from Sadara. Variable definitions are presented in Table 7a and the mean and standard deviation for each variable in Table 7b below.

[13] In Table 7, we are presenting two models. In one we are analysing the effects of educational levels on the probability to migrate and in the other we are analysing the effects of occupation on the probability to migrate. Both these variables cannot be included in one regression because of multi-colinearity; educational variables are strongly correlated to occupational variables, which would mean that coefficients would not be accurate. The regressions in both this table, and in Table 8, were found overall highly significant.

Table 7a: Definition of Variables

Variable	Definition
Migrate	Whether individual has migrated from their village
Age	Age of Individual
Female	If individual is female
Single	If individual is not married
Married	If individual is married
Separated	If individual is divorced or separated
Agric	If individual's occupation is agriculture
Profess	If individual has a professional occupation
Expend	Amount of illness related expenditures in the last year
Loan	If person has asked for a loan in the last year
Hsaving	If person has savings in the last year
Socsec	If individual was beneficiary of a social security scheme in the last year
Achingaon	Whether individual is from the village of Achingaon
Sadar	Whether individual is from the village of Sadara
illit3	Individual has no completed level of education
primary3	Highest level of education obtained is primary
junsec3	Highest level of education obtained is junior secondary
secondary3	Highest level of education obtained is secondary
highered3	Higher level of education obtained is higher education
Yearseduc	Completed years of Education

Table 7b: Variable Descriptive Statistics

Variable	Mean	Std. Dev.
Migrate	0.11	0.13
age	26.69	18.69
female	0.46	0.50
single	0.48	0.50
married	0.49	0.50
separated	0.03	0.17
agric	0.14	0.34
profess	0.06	0.24
expend	923.04	5708.26
loan	0.08	0.27
hsaving	0.09	0.29
socsec	0.06	0.24
Achingaon	0.57	0.50
illit3	0.08	0.28
primary3	0.44	0.50
junsec3	0.21	0.41
secondary3	0.14	0.34
highered3	0.13	0.34
yearseduc	3.70	4.26

If one moves to Table 8, a much more detailed comparative analysis becomes possible. As per the first regression, it is interesting to note that single men have a higher propensity to migrate than married men, but even amongst women, single women are much more likely to migrate than married women, though slightly less than married men. For women in particular, irrespective of location, marriage appears to be a key defining element in terms of choice of occupations and decisions to migrate, a point made by Jahanara above but also by Jeffrey, Jeffery and Jeffery (2005) in the context of rural women in Bijnor, India. When one moves to activities, it is interesting to note that white-collar workers in both villages have a higher propensity to migrate and agriculturists lower, yet the category of non-farm workers in Achingaon are much more likely to migrate out than in Sadara. A large part of this migration appears to be related to poverty, the lack of local employment opportunities and the need to earn and often results in migrants accepting sub-optimal working conditions as revealed in this study. They take up factory jobs, as part of a strategy to ultimately to go overseas. In Sadara this category of men seek out local self-employment.

Table 8: Village-level Differences in Migration Factors: Further Probit Regressions

	Coef Reg 1	**Coef Reg2**
Constant	-5.549841*	-4.319659*
age_yt1	.2633859*	.2331848*
age_2	-.0036889*	-.0033184*
Femsingle	-.2993358	-.4188769
Femmarried	-1.672336*	-1.641682*
Femsepar	-.8483732*	-.6829927**
Malesingle	.5678694*	.4177666*
Achingaon other	1.015952*	
Professachingaon	1.794546*	1.1603*
Agricachingaon	-.0992608	-.7315765*
Professsadar	2.128707*	1.488578*
Agricsadar	-.8822914**	-1.532433*
expend	-.0000276**	-.0000333*
loan	-.4035569	-.1436009
hsaving	-.0818366	-.7698542
socsec	-.8337166*	-.7698542*

* Variable is significant with 95 per cent confidence.

** Variable is significant with 90 per cent confidence.

Number of obs = 1618

Regression 1: The variable male married forms the base category and is not included in the regression, so this acts as a reference variable and each other gender/ marital status category is compared to this one. There were no male separated, hence this category does not appear in the regression. For example, being female and single reduces the probability of migrating relative to being male and married. Also, dummies for agricultural, non agricultural and professional individuals from each village are created. The variable non agricultural (other) from Sadara is not included in the regression and acts as the reference variable. So each coefficient, namely agriculture and professional for Sadara and agriculture, professional and non-agricultural (other) for Achingaon is to be interpreted in comparison to individuals who are not in agriculture in Sadara.

Regression 2: Marital status is the same as in regression 1. The difference is that the dummy variable that indicates people that are not in agriculture from Sadara is also not included this time. Therefore professionals and people in agriculture are compared to individuals who are not in agriculture (irrespective of village).

Who goes from a household and who stays does not seem to be an individual decision, but is linked to the opportunities and life chances that individuals and households have before them. Gender and life cycle are key factors mediating this decision, given the social roles and responsibilities they carry. But context too seems to be important, with the locational variable appearing to play a key role in the migration decision. While differences in levels of poverty do exist and constitute a strong push factor from Achingaon, this is perhaps inadequate for explaining the locational difference altogether. Neither can the existence of social networks do so, as both villages have strong social networks in Dhaka and overseas. A slightly different explanation of social capital, rooted in ideas of local capitalism and civic engagement as contributing to socio-economic welfare, may in fact partially help explain the reasons for non-migration. Local economic growth in Sadara could be one explanatory factor that has indeed enhanced the local quality of life and created an incentive for people to stay within their communities. Another explanation relates to religious solidarity and the participation in religious associations (Tolbert et al. 1998). While this does not really seem to hold true for the two Bangladesh villages, with Achingaon in fact seeming to have much greater levels of religious activity than Sadara, it could definitely emerge as a key factor explaining non-migration in Mahari in India. The Hindus here are averse to migration, which is seen as polluting and demeaning. There is also a discourse constructed around the good quality of life at home, rather than having to struggle for survival outside. As already mentioned, Hindus do migrate, but only for regular, salaried jobs.

It is worth pointing to the negative correlation between social security provision and migration in Table 8. Social security here primarily refers to school stipends and scholarships. Those who avail of them are more likely to complete their secondary schooling as in Sadara (Table 9), and move on to salaried jobs, rather than for the range of informal, manual and manufacturing jobs sought by people from Achingaon. Continuation of scholarships is dependent on a minimum score of 50 per cent, together with 75 per cent attendance. In Sadara, with better quality provision, continuation in education is ensured by the special efforts made by the teachers and the school. In Achingaon, poverty and poorer quality of provision combine to make children lose interest in school and look for ways to earn an income.

Table 9: Social Security in Study Villages

Social security schemes	Sadara			Achingaon			Mahari		
	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T
VGF card/subsidized ration card	5 (20)	3 (8)	8 (12.5)	24 (56)	7 (26)	31 (44)	56 (52)	9 (19)	64 (41)
Widow pension	-	1 (2.5)	1 (1.5)	-	-	-	-	13 (27)	13 (8)
Old age benefit	4 (16)	5 (13)	9 (14)	4 (9)	3 (11)	7 (10)	6 (5.5)	-	6 (4)
Scholarship	15 (60)	29 (74.5)	44 (69)	11 (26)	17 (63)	28 (40)	40 (37)	26 (54)	66 (42.5)
Freedom fighter/other	1 (4)	1 (2)	2 (3)	4 (9)	-	4 (6)	2 (2)	-	2 (1.5)
Free rations	-	-	-	-	-	-	4 (3.5)	1 (2)	5 (3)
	25	39	64	43	27	70	108	48	156

Figures in brackets are percentages

While data for Katona is not available, scholarships appear to be the single most important transfer made by the state in favour of the poor. While all ST children are eligible for

scholarships, given the size of the ST population in Mahari (176 households with 630 persons), and almost 157 eligible children, the actual distribution of scholarships is not high. It does reflect the fact that only a little over a third of eligible ST children are in school. As in the case of the secondary stipends in Bangladesh, the scholarship is insufficient to meet all the educational expenses of the child. Further, the quality of schooling being poor, the incentive to study, despite the existence of the scholarship, is not high. Apart from a few widow and old age pensions, the only other form of social support is through the subsidized food cards, locally called 'lalcard' (or red card). While kerosene oil for lighting lamps is available on this card, food grains are but rarely.

Other forms of informal social security such as membership in groups were not explored in this study, but they too are likely to have an impact on migration decisions. Rasheda, a migrant to Bahrain was able to secure a small loan from her Grameen group which enabled her to migrate; the amount however was not sufficient to finance her husband. She blamed state policies for this state of affairs: 'The government has devalued the labour of men in relation to women. Women can get jobs in garment factories, but for men there is no employment. They have to go overseas to work, but even here while a woman needs 70,000 taka to go abroad, a man needs 240,000 taka. There are certain social traditions which bind a woman to the care of her family and children, yet government policies forced me to go for preserving our family, as we had no money to pay for my husband'. The difference in the cost for men and women going abroad seems partly related to the type of jobs they can get overseas and hence potential earnings as well as the channels for migration. Most women appear to go through personal contacts rather than through agents. Even where agents are involved, their charges are lower for women, and so women save on much of the transaction costs involved in migration.

5. THE MIGRATION EXPERIENCE

Having briefly profiled the nature of the migrants from the four village sites, I turn next to understanding their migration experience. I examine three inter-related aspects of this experience, namely, the reasons for migration, the channel or process of migration (with a particular emphasis on the networks used) and the benefits of migration, in terms of earnings and remittances. As it was not possible to follow-up on the range of migration flows, the major migrant labour markets have been captured through in-depth case studies. In the case of the Indian villages, this involves male migration from Mahari to the sugarcane fields of Western Uttar Pradesh and female migration from Katona to Delhi as domestic workers. In the case of Achingaon, two data sources are used: interviews with women garment workers and men in welding shops in Dhaka, and a survey of migrants conducted by the Impact Monitoring and Evaluation Cell (IMEC) of Proshika in 2005. A clear pattern in terms of migration sectors did not emerge in Sadara, pointing to the diversification in terms of jobs, destinations and channels of access. Given the limitations of time, it was difficult to pursue these in greater detail, though insights based on the survey and interviews conducted are provided.

Reasons for Migration

A major reason for migration across the study sites is the lack of local employment and the need to earn money for survival as well as for accumulation. As one villager in Achingaon said, 'Ten to fifteen years ago people from Manikganj thana mostly worked in agriculture. But now this is impossible, so people are going to Savar, Nabinagar, Manikganj and Dhaka for different types of work. They get jobs and earn money to support their families. The quality of work depends on the level of education because those who are well educated get better jobs. They can join the police and army, while the less educated work in the welding shops and garment factories' (Dilbar, 19, student, Hafezia).

Table 10: Reasons for Migration

Reasons of migration	Achingaon			Migrant earnings more than original	Migrant earnings equal to original	Sadara	Mahari	Katona
	M*	F*	T	Achingaon	Achingaon			
Financial crisis in the household	33 (21)	7 (35)	116 (89)	23 (32)	17 (29)	83 (86)	57 (39)	13 (12.5)
Freedom	38 (24)	6 (30)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Job opportunity	38 (24)	3 (15)	13 (10)	18 (25)	23 (39)	12 (12)	50 (34)	79 (75)
Local conflict	21 (13)	0	-	11 (16)	10 (17)	2 (2)		-
Abuse/harassment	28 (18)	4 (20)	1 (1)	19 (27)	9 (15)	-	1 (1)	3 (3)
Education	-	-	-	-	-	-	38* (26)	10 (9.5)
Total	158	20	130	71	59	97	146	105

Multiple responses are provided. Figures in brackets are percentages.
Source for calculation of migrant earnings is Migration Survey of Achingaon conducted by IMEC, Proshika in 2005.

A critical factor motivating migration is the desire to earn money. This is also the most common response from the Indian case studies, where poverty and unemployment form the major push

factor for migration, a majority giving financial crisis and the lack of job opportunities locally as reasons for migration. Migrants from Mahari to Bhajju village in western Uttar Pradesh noted almost unanimously that even though the work was hard, it assured them of cash earnings for 8-9 months of the year, from September to June, when there was no work to be done at home. As Taru Soren noted, 'We have a small plot of land, there is not much work to be done there. While we do produce rice for food, there is a shortage of cash for meeting other needs. My father did not have enough money to educate me, but I hope to educate my younger brother from my earnings.' So while food per se is apparently not the main push factor for migrants from Mahari, it is the need to earn cash to meet medical expenses, costs of building a house, the marriage of a sister, and so on. Agriculture clearly is not able to support all of a family's needs.

In Katona too the concern is not so much with food per se, but here the focus is on accumulation, to build capital for diversification. Alfonsh Kerketta, who has passed his high school examination and is working in Max Hospital Delhi as a hospital assistant, was very clear that he wanted to return to his village with enough capital to start his own business in either poultry or fishery. His family engages in cultivation. Sunil Tete is only 19, and working as housekeeping staff at Max Hospital. He is trying to save money in Delhi to pay for the schooling of his two younger brothers and sister. His parents engage in agriculture and some of the money he sends is used for the purchase of agricultural inputs.

Another reason for migration emerging in Achingaon is the desire for freedom. Jamser, a teacher, noted: 'People are looking for work that gives them freedom. Working on another's land from morning to evening in slave-like conditions is no longer acceptable to many people. They are buying vans and rickshaws and pulling them on the road at their will. This gives them a sense of freedom in their work.' Freedom here is translated as self-employment and this appears to be the aspiration of all those who cannot get salaried jobs. In the Indian context, while earning, providing and accumulating seemed to be the goals of most male migrants, the desire for freedom and autonomy was most visible amongst the girls migrating to Delhi for domestic work. As a young girl from Mahari noted, 'My family took me for granted. I had to do all the household chores. When I heard that a lady from the next village was taking a few girls to Delhi, I decided to go. At least I would earn something for the work I did.' With improvements in communication and the beginnings of a migration stream, rural girls are becoming more aware of alternatives and unwilling to quietly accept the burden of domestic tasks that invariably falls on them, and which is barely recognised.

Conflict, harassment and abuse also emerge as significant factors pushing people to migrate in Bangladesh. While the exact nature of these is not very clear from this research, it appears to be linked to the idea of freedom, autonomy and self-respect. For women in particular, divorce and abandonment are factors that influence their migration. As 19-year-old Delwar Hossain pointed out: 'My father used to take drugs; he went mad, left his business and started beating my mother, who then took us to my grandparents' house. My mother's sister worked in a garment factory at Savar, so finding no alternative, my mother too started working there. She worked for eight years. In the meantime my father recovered and became a gentleman in the village, so we returned home.' The implication of course is that a woman as a wife is entitled to provisioning from her husband, and only when this fails is she required to fend for herself. And this is not possible without other forms of social support, in this case from her parents and sister. But when the marriage was revived, she was once again expected to stay at home. As mentioned earlier, for a married woman to migrate for work is considered a sign of utter desperation and poverty, reflecting negatively on the status of her husband.

The Process of Migration

a) The costs involved

One hears talk of the debts taken at exorbitant interest rates to finance migration and wonders at the viability of such migration. It is therefore quite interesting to note from Table 10 that 55 per cent of the migrants from Achingaon (71 out of 130) did in fact earn more than what they would have had, had they not migrated. The mean earnings prior to migration was 3,481 taka and after migration 4,839 taka, a difference of 1,357 taka or an increase of almost 28 per cent. Returns of course varied by the type of migration – whether it was internal or international, rural or urban -- but so did the costs. While organising migration internally cost approximately 13,700 taka, international migration required at least five times more investment, on average 92,500 taka (Table 11a). Migration to developed countries such as South Korea required 4-500,000 taka, and so could only be afforded by a few in Sadara.

Another factor influencing returns is the source of financing for the migration. While internal migration could largely be financed through savings and borrowings from family, international migration required either the disposal of assets such as land or livestock or borrowing from moneylenders at high rates of interest (Table 11b). As noted by Rasheda, the reason she migrated to Bahrain rather than her husband was because of the lower costs involved for her as a woman. Hasina's elder brother-in-law had to sell his land for financing the cost of his migration to Singapore. Awal drew on the savings of his family members to finance his migration.

Table 11a: Costs of Migration: Bangladesh Villages

Amount in taka	Achingaon	Sadara
Less than 100,000	10 (32)	23 (46)
100,001 - 150,000	7 (22.5)	5 (10)
150,001 – 200,000	12 (39)	13 (26)
200,000 – 300,000	2 (6.5)	4 (8)
Over 300,000	-	5 (10)
Total	31 (100)	50 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

Table 11b: Sources of Financing Migration – Achingaon

	Internal	International
Savings	70 (84.25)	9 (19.5)
Selling land/livestock	-	11 (24)
Loans from neighbours, family, in-laws, lenders etc	12 (14.5)	25 (54.5)
Mortgaging land	1 (1.25)	1 (2)
Total	83 (100)	46 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

Abdul Kuddus is a 35-year-old man, married and with one child. He went to Saudi Arabia three years ago. Before marriage there was an agreement that his father-in-law would send him to Saudi Arabia, hence his brothers-in-law got him his visa, which cost 50,000 taka. Before leaving Bangladesh he worked in a welding workshop in Dhaka, and this enabled him to get similar work in Saudi Arabia. Apart from his visa, other expenses were met through different

means – by mortgaging 50 decimals of arable land for 5,000 taka and his own savings of 35,000 taka. His brothers-in-law live in Saudi Arabia and this has substantially helped him in reducing his costs and maximizing returns. It is interesting to note that dowries often take the form of finances for an overseas migration. The bride's father feels that this is an investment that can lead to the future wellbeing of his daughter.

b) The role of networks in securing a job

People secure information about jobs through many channels. There are only a few who manage these through advertisements, and they are the more educated applicants for salaried jobs. A vast majority of migrants secure jobs through friends, relatives and neighbours, people who have migrated in the past, or are presently migrants (Table 12). This particularly applies to lower-end jobs, either in factories or as manual labour. As reported by Shamme, a garment factory worker from Achingaon, 'I have been working in a garment factory in Savar for one year. I studied at the alia madrasa, but could not appear for the dakhil examination due to poverty. One of my relatives arranged this job for me. While boys go to the fields to help their fathers, girls are either married, as they are considered mature, or some of them go to the EPZ and Savar garment factory to earn money for their family or for their own dowry'. The same story was repeated by other garment workers, both male and female – a sister, an aunt or an uncle is involved in the process of getting access to jobs in the garment factories.

Table 12: How Jobs Are Secured

How job was secured	Achingaon	Sadara	Mahari	Katona
Advertisement	-	2 (2)	-	-
Relatives	68 (52)	32 (33)	4 (3.5)	12 (11.5)
Friends	3 (2.5)	1 (1)	33 (29.5)	19 (18)
Broker/agent	10 (7.5)	20 (21)	7 (6)	18 (17)
Own initiative	49 (38)	42 (43)	-	20 (19)
Employer	-	-	10 (9)	2 (2)
Neighbours	-	-	23 (20.5)	10 (9.5)
Not answered	-		35 (31.5)	24 (23)
Total	130 (100)	97 (100)	112 (100)	105 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

Several young men from Katona go to Delhi in search of jobs. They often go on their own initiative, but carry the address of a friend, a relative or a neighbour from the village, who would accommodate them, at least initially, and perhaps even help them find a job[14]. People rarely act on the basis of mass media information alone, unless it is also transmitted through personal ties. These may not be close kin as in the case of the Bangladesh example, but rather people who provide 'bridging ties' to the outside world (Granovetter 1973). Chandanhola, a village on the outskirts of Delhi, close to both the industrial areas and farms of Gurgaon, has become a mini-Jharkhand. With over 300 migrants from different villages of Simdega district living here, it is an example of what Portes and Sensenbrenner (1993: 1324) have called 'bounded solidarity' -- a form of social support that results from a shared identity, often marginalized and finding itself in an adverse situation. This notion reflects a shift away from a purely instrumentalist and utilitarian approach to social capital and social networks, to one that is embedded at least to a

[14] In terms of responses, own initiative here primarily relates to those who have gone for religious work, while for the category being discussed, relatives, friends and neighbours seem to be important.

certain degree in a moral obligation towards one's own. Services here are poorly developed, but house rents are low, hence it becomes possible to live within one's limited means. Many of the youth work in farm-houses, in construction and as care-takers of large houses, but the more educated are able to secure jobs in factories or services. Their earnings range between Rs 1,000 to Rs 6,000 per month. Vinod Soreng, 28 years old, first came to Delhi in 2002 as a cook, but soon joined Nisarg Enterprises, an export-oriented candle-making unit, as a helper. Young and energetic, he rapidly picked up the skills required and today is a technical person, earning Rs 3,250 per month. His wife and three children live with him in Delhi. This makes him more settled in Delhi and less committed to the family in the village, though he does aspire to build a house there. While Chandanhola reflects an attempt to reconstruct a sense of community solidarity and identity in Delhi, this does not seem to have obstructed individual mobility, contrary to the findings of Portes and Sensenbrenner (1993) and Munshi and Rosenzweig (2003). While some degree of facilitating support is provided, free riding does not really seem to be acceptable, as ultimately each one lives independently, though within the community, finding their own jobs and making their own lives.

Islam Ansari, a young Muslim man from Mahari, was taken in 1996, along with five other boys, to Bhajju village in Muzaffarnagar district of Uttar Pradesh, by a policeman from that district to work on his sugarcane fields at home. Sugarcane cultivation is widespread in this region, given the irrigation facilities, a good market and a favourable price. After paying for all costs, a farmer can still hope to make an earning of Rs 20-25,000 per acre of land. Islam worked for 10 months, then returned home with Rs 7,000, as his elder brother had met with an accident and money was needed for his treatment. Over the years, he migrated there again and again, taking other boys with him, working for a Jat landlord, Raj Kumar Chaudhry. He found that large farmers there did not cheat their labour as it was important for them to get the work done on time and local labour was scarce. Two years ago the landlord asked Islam to take on the role of his recruiting agent, agreeing to pay him a commission of Rs 1,500 per labourer, which includes their travel costs. Islam recruits primarily Santal boys from Mahari and its surrounding villages and takes them in batches of 10-20 to Bhajju. He is also responsible for bringing them home safely after 8-10 months of work. In 2006, he took more than 80 Santal boys, more than half from Mahari, to Bhajju and surrounding villages in Shamli block. The boys are paid about Rs 1,800 per month as a wage. Of this around Rs 800 is deducted to meet their food and accommodation costs, and the rest is given as cash payment. Muslim boys seem to prefer the coal business – they can earn much more, almost Rs 700 in two trips per week, but of course they face the risk of being caught and beaten by the police. Islam is a local man, his family lives in Mahari, and to that extent, he ensures that the labour that he supplies to Bhajju get a fair deal. He earns a handsome commission, and even though the migrant workers barely earn the minimum wage, they are at least assured of this earning. They get their payment in a lump sum when they are about to go home. They could also seek to be paid in instalments, which they then send home through money orders.

But not all agents are as responsible. As Nanamai, a young Santal woman migrant from Mahari noted, 'Seven girls were taken by an "aunt" from the locality to Delhi by train and left in a placement agency. There were 6 other girls there and all 13 of us were kept in a tiny room, allowed to come out only when prospective employers came for recruitment and wanted to interview us. I was given some clothes and toiletries by the placement agency and for this they took away the first two months' salary. I worked from early morning to late in the night, cooking for six people, making umpteen cups of tea, cleaning the house, washing clothes and utensils. I slept on the kitchen floor and was threatened with beatings if I complained of fatigue and overwork. I was to be paid Rs 1,200 per month. I left after three months as I could not stand it

any longer, so got only a month's pay. Even this was taken from me by my aunt's daughter at the station, so I returned home empty-handed.' Once she moved to her employers, Nanamai also lost touch with the other girls from her village, despite attempts to find out where they were and talk to them occasionally. While the agent is designated an 'aunt', clearly she was interested only in her commission.

A majority of domestic workers are recruited by private agents (there are estimated to be over 500 placement agencies in Delhi alone (Kujur and Jha 2006)), who are only interested in their profits, not the welfare of the workers. In Katona, agents from private agencies in Delhi have recruited several girls. The parents have their visiting cards, but repeated phone calls produce no contact with their daughters. Sitamoni's father wept, 'I have only one daughter and they have stolen her. She has been gone for over two years and has never phoned even once. I have now filed a police complaint and will kill the person who has taken her'. Another girl, Sangeeta, the daughter of a fisherman, came back this year, but had no news of the others. She was in Delhi for three years; each year the agency would change the house she worked in, so they could get an additional commission. Her earnings were deposited with them, and as they would not let her leave, she had to come home secretly. She has hence lost a large part of her earnings.

One also finds a few public-oriented agencies. One example is provided by the Catholic Mission, which has set up a domestic worker's welfare agency in Delhi to help recruit and train workers, but also to ensure them a decent wage and living conditions. A few girls from Katona like Asrita Soreng have secured jobs in Delhi through this route – they get regular leave, both to visit home once a year, but also on Sundays to go to church, and the agreed wages. In fact, the agency also negotiates an annual wage increment with the employers. Domestic work is one migration stream where trust is very important: the worker lives in the home of the employer. Employers in Delhi prefer going through agencies to ensure some security for themselves. A few exceptional cases go through friends such as Victoria Dungdung from Katona, who went with her friend Prabha to Delhi. She stayed with her the first few days, and Prabha's employer helped locate a house for her to work in.

Like the domestic workers in India, most of the overseas migrants from Bangladesh also secure their jobs through agents and brokers. As already mentioned, the government has set up BOESL (Bangladesh Overseas Employement and Services Limited) for this purpose, but also regulates the activities of BAIRA (Bangladesh Association of International Recruiting Agencies), an association of private agencies, insisting that jobs secured overseas should include payment of at least minimum wages. Yet, as Anisur Rahman narrated, 'I gave money to an agent to prepare my papers, but when I went to collect them, I found the name and details did not match. I therefore refused this offer, but also lost the money I had paid. I then studied for a few years and got an administrative job in Saudi Arabia, but there found that many Bengalis were facing the same problem. The agents preferred recruiting less educated people for unskilled labour jobs as they are able to extract more commission from them. The papers are often not in order, hence there is no way a worker can protest or lodge a complaint if he/she does not get proper wages. They could be harassed, imprisoned or deported for being illegal workers. Dual contracts were made – the papers showed particular jobs, but on arrival they were usually engaged as manual workers at much lower wages. After five years when I returned from Saudi Arabia, I decided to set up an organization called WARBE, along with other friends and former migrants, to help raise awareness amongst migrants and protect them from being swindled'. While the official cost of overseas migration is 84,000 taka, most of the villagers end up spending close to two lakh taka, the balance being commissions to the chain

of middlemen and agents.

Where the ties are strong, that is, the migrant has followed an aunt or an uncle, rather than going through an agent (an exception being the church), the chances of success are higher. The nexus of exploitative agents working with some local women or men who are paid a handsome commission, as in the case of girls migrating for domestic work from Jharkhand to Delhi in India, makes this point clear. They work hard and rarely receive their full pay. Several girls have returned home penniless, cheated of all their earnings. Girls who have accompanied close friends, stayed with them, and got jobs through their employers, however, are better off (see also Curran and Saguy 2001). Even amongst overseas migrants, a few such as Kuddus or Rasheda who manage to go overseas with the support of relatives and friends end up in a better position than those who go through agents. Of course, they were also seen to possess some skills, in this case, welding and domestic work respectively (see also Shah and Menon 1999).

The process by which jobs are secured impacts on the experience of migration as this can enhance or reduce the problems faced at the destination by migrant workers. As seen from Table 13, issues of salary payment as well as harassment, including by the police, are problems faced by international migrants, a large number of who go through agents. The latter often take large sums of money, but show no responsibility for ensuring that all papers are in order, making the migration itself illegal. Several migrants have been caught by the police and first imprisoned and then deported from Malaysia. Hasina's husband used to work in a shop in Malaysia and was doing quite well, until he was caught gambling with some friends, and gambling is illegal there. The police soon found that his visa was not in order, so he lost his job and the authorities sent him home. Given the largely privatized and unregulated nature of such migration, deportation of illegal workers appears to be a regular feature. Kibria (2004) notes that 50,000 Bangladeshi workers were deported from Saudi Arabia and UAE in 1996 and 100,000 from Malaysia in 2001. These migrants also tend to be the less educated. Sabina, for instance, worked for six months as a domestic worker in Saudi, but was not paid her wages. She had to spend 115,000 taka to get her passport released from her employers and find another job.

c) Problems encountered during the migration process

Apart from physical insecurity, harassment and abuse, harsh working conditions seem to be the single most important problem faced by migrants. They get no leave, they work for long hours, and often their salary is deducted for a range of reasons. Rasheda was ill in Bahrain and while her employers did admit her into a hospital, they deducted the costs of this from the payment due to her. Awal had to work a double shift, close to 15 hours a day, in order to earn enough to repay the loan he had taken and save some money to remit home.

Table 13a: Problems Faced at Destination by Type of Migration: Bangladesh

Problem faced at destination	Type of migration		Total	Women
	Internal	International		
Health problems	14 (13)	6 (13)	20 (13)	1 (7)
Problem of sending money home	4 (3.5)	3 (6.5)	7 (4.5)	-
Physical insecurity/harassment /abuse/police	17 (15.5)	7 (15)	24 (15)	3 (21.5)
Food problem/poor diet	10 (9)	5 (10.5)	15 (9.5)	-
Unhygienic sanitation/accommodation	2 (2)	2 (4)	4 (2.5)	-
Harsh Working Conditions/no leave	39 (35.5)	7 (15)	46 (29)	5 (35.5)
Low standard of safety/injury	4 (3.5)	1 (2)	5 (3)	-
Lack of respect/status	2 (2)	5 (10.5)	7 (4.5)	2 (14.5)
Language Problems/others	7 (6)	3 (6.5)	10 (6.5)	-
Problems of payment of salary	11 (10)	7 (15)	18 (11.5)	3 (21.5)
Total	110 (100)	47 (100)	157 (100)	14 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

The issue of harsh working conditions however applies to all migrant workers, not just those who have gone through agents. Workers to the garment factories and welding shops too face long working hours and get hardly any leave, several of them developing severe health problems in the process. Jharna, for instance, has been working in a garment factory for four months. As a helper in the button section, her salary was fixed at 900 taka. She rented a house in Nabinagar along with other girls working in the same factory for 500 taka per month. She worked over 14 hours a day, but got no overtime. Her salary was not enough to manage even her own living expenses, so she finally returned home. There are a large number of men too, working in the garment industry. Though they earn more than the women, their working conditions are not easy either. Farid got 1800 taka per month as salary, but in addition to the normal office hours from 8am to 5pm, he had to work until 9pm every night without overtime. He received overtime wages only if he stayed beyond 9 pm. He soon left this factory and got another job, but the hard work, standing all day on the shop floor, made him give this up too. He returned home and is currently unemployed.

Apart from a high turnover of workers, both male and female, what these stories also demonstrate is not just wage differentials between men and women and the different jobs to which they are assigned, but also the male concern for the nature of work – hard work, constantly under supervision, which takes away their freedom, is disliked.

It is the same in the welding shops, though men generally perceive this as an apprenticeship, a skill that once learnt will enable them to get a job overseas. In the words of Monowar, a 22-year-old welding shop worker, who studied till class 5, 'I have been working in a shop for seven years at Balughat cantonment in Dhaka. At the very beginning when I was learning, I got only food, accommodation and transport costs, no salary. I lived in the shop with other colleagues, taking my bedding from home. After two years I started earning 2500 taka per month and now I live in a rented house. During the probation, I worked for 12 hours from 8am to 8pm, with half an hour for lunch and rest. Now, I work for 15 hours a day, from 9am till midnight and earn 3500 taka per month. I hope that I can save some money and then go overseas'.

In India, too, while data on problems is not available for Katona village, the migrant agricultural workers to the sugarcane fields from Mahari had to work 12 hours a day, with a small break for lunch. Domestic workers had even less time off work; they are virtually on call all 24 hours. Ill-health as a result of migration is often mentioned as a problem. Most of the workers are

malnourished and weak to start with, and hard labour for over 12 hours a day is not something their bodies can easily cope with. They fall sick at their workplace, and apart from no one to look after them while they are sick, they also end up losing wages and additionally spending money on health care. Meena from Katona, a 16-year-old girl, first went to Delhi in 2003, when she was barely 13. She returned home after two years, but thereafter migrated to Delhi again in 2006 along with other girls from her hamlet like Sangeeta, Phudo Kumari and Arti, as her mother, a widow, was unable to make ends meet in the village. The agency, Sahid Enterprises located in Moti Nagar in Delhi, placed her with a Sikh family. Meena was made to work very hard, waking up at 6 am and unable to go to bed before 2 am every day. 'I did all the housework, cleaning the house, washing utensils, cooking food, making tea several times while the housewife watched television all day and never helped with the work', she said. Unable to cope, Meena complained to her employers but got harshly reprimanded for her laziness. She grew weaker as they did not give her enough to eat. She developed a pain in the chest, but suffered in silence for a long time as she was scared of approaching her employers now. She finally told them that she wanted to leave after the husband in the house threatened to hit her for her laziness. She went to the station and bought herself a ticket to return home. She is still very weak and the local doctor has diagnosed her as having a heart problem. Shabnam Kullu has a similar story to tell. She developed a large swelling on her leg while in Delhi. This was not treated, it got worse, and she returned home, but can hardly move now. Health care thus becomes a major expense.

Table 13b: Problems Faced at Destination by Migrants from Mahari, India

Problems faced	Mahari
Looting on way back	23 (20.5)
Shortage of labour in village for cultivation	36 (32)
Have to leave family	7 (6)
No one to look after when fall sick	16 (14)
Money used to repay loans	3 (2.5)
Not answered	27 (24)
Total	112 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

What emerges from these accounts is that having social networks that facilitate the migration process does reduce the costs and risks of migration, though it does not necessarily mitigate the harsh working conditions. Those who have migrated without their own trusted networks or contacts are much more likely to be cheated and have a negative experience. In a later section, I will come back to the issue of networks in relation to educational levels – does higher education enable people to migrate independently, without networks, and is such migration more transformative than that entered into through strong familial and kin networks?

d. Remittances

Since the major reason for migration is earning money, remittances constitute an important element of the experience of migration. The amounts vary as do their uses. Seasonal migrants from Mahari usually carry back a lumpsum of Rs 6-7000 when they return home. This has been used for a variety of purposes: purchase of food, purchase of livestock, purchase of inputs for agriculture, purchase of assets such as bicycles, leasing in land, investment for self-employment, medical expenses or marriage purposes. Clearly the aspiration is to accumulate assets in the village, which will ultimately contribute to establishing a more sustainable and diversified livelihood locally, reducing the need for repeated migrations. Accumulation is

particularly important in the context of sugarcane cultivation as this is taxing and most of the migrants cannot sustain it physically after a few years. Indeed, a major barrier to successful accumulation by the Santals is stated to be ill-health, a large amount of their earnings being spent on medical expenses (Rana and Johnson 2003; Rana et al. 2005). Sen (2003) too demonstrates that ill health was the second most important factor for downward mobility in his Bangladesh sample. While the Santals attempt to strengthen their land-based livelihoods from their migrant earnings, one does not find major investments in agriculture, housing or business. This is perhaps to be expected (Table 14a), as the average remittances are very low. The Muslims, on the other hand, seek to set up small businesses. Anwar has earned enough money to set up a small shop in Mahari and Naseem has opened an STD booth in his village.

Table 14a: Amount of Remittances: India

Amount in Rs/year	Mahari	Katona
Less than 1,000	53 (45.5)	1 (1)
1,001-5,000	23 (20)	5 (4.5)
5,001-10,000	39 (33.5)	8 (7.5)
Over 10,000	1 (1)	2 (2)
No response	-	89 (85)
Total	116 (100)	105 (100)
Average Remittance	4120*	4718

* Varies from an average of Rs 3,666 for STs to Rs 5,123 for Hindu groups.
Figures in brackets are percentages

In Katona the pattern seems to be somewhat different, though it needs to be mentioned that data on remittances was both scarce and vague. While the female domestic workers do bring money home, information was only available from those who were visiting home. As already mentioned, several girls were missing, and a few tended to save their earnings in order to eventually invest in a house or plot of land. Men who migrated as construction workers hardly saved any money after meeting their expenses, but agricultural workers did bring home a lump sum varying from Rs 4,000 to Rs 10,000 as in the case of Mahari. The male youth who went to the factories and other private jobs in Delhi hardly remitted any money home; they may bring gifts when they visited the village. Often they took their families to the city, and while they do contribute to the maintenance of their parents or other relatives in the village, such remittances are by no means regular. Vinod Soreng, as already mentioned, sends money to his parents only occasionally, giving them some when he visits the village. It is the same with Baneshwar and his wife Deepan; they only send money home during emergencies. They have been in Delhi for close to eight years; he works as a security guard and earlier she worked as a housemaid. When their children were born, her sister came from the village to take care of them and do the housework. But soon she found a job herself, so Deepan quit her job to take care of the children. Again, women who become nuns and leave the village do not remit money home; their own needs however are fully taken care of. Those in the army were responsible for maintaining their families at home and presumably did remit regularly, though the amounts were hard to discover.

A major purpose of overseas migration is to earn money for household provisioning. But, in Achingaon and Sadara, as several of them had taken loans at high rates of interest to facilitate their migration, a large part of their remittances, especially in the first few years after migration, were spent on repaying loans (Tables 14b and 15a). The remittance amount is however split between several uses in most instances. Sabina has sent 200,000 taka to her parents in the village in four years. Her parents had taken a loan of 70,000 taka for her migration in addition

to mortgaging 120 decimals of arable land. This has now been repaid in full. Her parents did not spend the money on food or clothes for themselves; a small amount was however donated to the mosque. Her father hopes that future remittances can be spent on building a house, collecting a dowry for Sabina's marriage and buying some land and cows. While parents seem to have greater control over the remittances from their daughters (seen also in other studies such as Curran 1996), the spending pattern for married male migrants is often different, as they have wives and children to support. A large number of them want to save some of the remittance money to set up their own business in the village in the future, as living apart from their wives and children for many years at a stretch can get emotionally lonely and unsettling. Hasina's husband Kamal sent back 2 lakh takas in the course of a year. Some of this was used for repairing the house, some for repaying the loan taken for migration and some for the education of his younger brothers. But he also helped one of his brothers start a mobile shop, hoping to join him in due course. Babul from Sadara spent eight years in Saudi Arabia. He had sold his land in order to migrate. He returned finally with 1.2 million takas, bought land, made a brick house with a latrine, invested in a tubewell and set up a fruit business in Dhaka Cantonment.

Table 14b: Amount of Remittances: Bangladesh

Amount in taka/year	Sadara	Achingaon
Less than 5,000	14 (17)	11 (11)
5,001-10,000	14 (17)	13 (13)
10,001-20,000	15 (18)	32 (31.5)
20,001-30,000	6 (7)	16 (15.5)
30,001-50,000	10 (12)	11 (11)
50,001-100,000	16 (19.5)	10 (10)
100,000-600,000	5 (6)	8 (8)
Over 600,000	3 (3.5)	-
Total	84 (100)	101 (100)
Average Remittance Internal	13789 (n= 72)	
Average Remittance International	92542 (n=21)	

Another purpose of remittances is to provide for dowries. While several of the young women working in the garment factories try to save up money for their own dowries, remittances from overseas also go a long way towards this. Kalpana's mother worked in Saudi Arabia as a housemaid. Her salary was not large, but she saved up all her earnings for her daughter's wedding. 20,000 taka were spent on her marriage. She returned to Saudi to save another 30,000 taka for the dowry for her second daughter. Of course there are problems and not everyone is able to save equally. As already mentioned, Rasheda fell ill, could not work and had to return home. All her savings were spent on her medical expenses and she had no money to bring home. A large part of the money remitted by Alamgir of Sadara is spent on health expenses at home. He works in a timber factory in South Korea earning 50,000 taka per month. His wife said, 'My father-in-law has been suffering from diabetes for many years and 60,000 taka is needed for his medicines annually. My brother-in-law has a mental disorder and his medicines cost 70,000 taka, also he cannot work, so our entire household runs on the remittance'.

Unlike in India, where average remittances are low and expectations are limited, the amounts involved are much higher in Bangladesh, and the difference between internal and international migrants' remittances is quite stark. While it is not surprising to note that a large proportion of the remittances are spent on household expenses, on repayment of loans and purchase of

land, construction of houses and investment in agriculture and livestock too emerge as important areas of usage, despite the low status that agriculture is seen to occupy (Table 15a). This is confirmed by other studies too that find that after food and clothing, the five major areas of remittance use are house construction, land purchase, loan repayment, social ceremonies and sending family members abroad (Siddiqui and Abrar 2002). As already mentioned, male migrants hope to save for their future by investing in some business venture in their home. As in the Indian sites, health expenditures emerge as a major area for remittance use in Achingaon. While the figures per se may not be accurate, the ways in which remittances are used do reflect the sorts of priorities that people have and give some insight into their future aspirations.

Table 15a: Use of Remittances: Bangladesh Villages

Use of Remittance	Achingaon		Sadara	
	Number	Per cent	Number	Per cent
Purchase of arable/ homestead land	15	7.5	4	4.5
Tin/brick-made house/ house repair	16	8	-	
Loan repayment	19	9.5	1	1
Marriage/dowry	3	1.5	-	-
Education expenses	9	4.5	3	3.5
Household expenses	78	39	67	75
Savings/business	8	4	7	8
Health expenses	19	9.5	-	
Agriculture/Tubewell	15	7.5	2	2
Livestock	8	4	-	
Consumer durables	10	5	5	6
Total	200	100	89	100

What is interesting to note is that despite the discourse around education and its importance for successful migration, not much of the remittance is actually being invested in education in the Bangladesh villages. Much more is being spent on consumer durables (Table 15b). A large number of international migrants in particular have invested in mobile phones to facilitate communication with their families. Achingaon is a poor village, with low literacy rates, yet the number of mobile phones is quite remarkable. TVs too may be found, though they are not as common as in Sadara, which enjoys a somewhat better standard of living. The study by Siddiqui and Abrar (2002) also find investment in consumer items such as cassette recorders, TVs, cameras and gold. Repair and building of new houses also appears to be a priority. The Indian villages are a contrast. Several in Mahari have purchased bicycles and a few transistor radios, but mobiles are still largely confined to the better off Hindus. There is no electricity in the Santal and Muslim hamlets, which might also explain the total absence of electronic gadgets. Many however are interested in investing in the education of their siblings or children, sending them to boarding schools or madrasas. While this information was not presented in terms of remittance use, as the investment in education is probably financed from other sources, the fact that several reported migrating for education (Table 10) is significant. In fact, there is likely to be some under-reporting here in terms of figures, but this was a strong narrative emerging from the in-depth interviews.

Table 15b: Distribution of Consumer Goods

Name of Asset	Achingaon	Sadara	Mahari
TV	17 (18)	34 (28.5)	-
Radio	26 (28)	23 (19)	14 (17)
Mobile	44 (47)	47 (39)	5 (6)
Refrigerator	2 (2)	2 (1.75)	-
Motorbike	1 (1)	2 (1.75)	1 (1)
VCD	4 (4)	12 (10)	-
Bicycle	Not asked	Not asked	62 (76)
Total	94 (100)	120 (100)	82 (100)

Note: This data is not collected for Katona. Some people have reported more than one asset.
Figures in brackets are percentages

There have been discussions around the pros and cons of remittances, especially from overseas migrants, for development. Studies on overseas migrants' use of remittances in Bangladesh seem to indicate that while the multiplier effect of remittances on consumption is 2.826, it is only 0.409 for investment spending (Murshid, Iqbal and Ahmed 2002). Others have challenged the view that remittances are only spent on conspicuous consumption and non-productive investments (de Haas 2005). While one cannot deny that development expenditures have indeed taken place, whether in business or agriculture, there appears to be a trade-off between consumption and education, two major pathways for social mobility. While it is true that six families of migrants have permanently moved from Achingaon to the nearby town in order to access better education for their children, in the overall scenario, the emphasis on education and human capital development does not appear to be very high.

A final point about the perceptions regarding migration and migrant work is in place, as irrespective of the experience of migration itself, the community and family ultimately measures success or failure in relation to the remittances and living conditions of the migrant household. In Bangladesh, with few local alternatives, migration seems to be the only way forward to earn money and invest in assets or businesses. Distance here becomes a crucial factor in terms of adding status, hence overseas migration is preferable to internal, and south-east Asia is preferred over the Middle East. While female migration is still looked down upon as the preserve of the 'poor', given the large numbers involved, perceptions are slowly changing. Yet, in a village like Achingaon, none of the garment workers interviewed was actually interested in making a career in the industry. Parents had adopted strategies to ensure control over their mobility and sexuality like having them commute to work from home, travel in groups and so on.

Given the diversity of migrant occupations and experiences in Katona, the perceptions of migration are also mixed, determined more by the type of job rather than the act of migration per se. In Mahari, however, migration continues to be looked down upon, partly because of the low returns it brings and the hard work involved, but also the clear ethnic divide. As Sheila in Mahari noted, 'My brother ran away to Delhi without telling anyone, he had no sense of duty. He worked as an attendant in a cinema theatre, but ultimately died of drug and alcohol abuse. He never sent any money or contacted any of us. I cannot myself see any difference in the standard of living for families with migrants'. Manto went to Delhi before he completed his grade 10 exams. He worked on a construction site, earning Rs 60 per day. It was tough, and he returned in a few months. He decided to write his secondary school exams in 2007, with

support from his relatives. He hopes to go to Delhi again, but not for the same type of work. He said, 'If I pass this time, I will continue my studies, and go when I can find a job. I want a good job, one that can help me earn enough money to change our lives here in the village. With such small amounts we can barely meet our day to day expenses, what can we do for our home?' There is an attempt by him to shift the discourse around migration in the local context, where Santals are expected to migrate due to their poverty, in order to make a living, hence with no consideration for the type or form of work they undertake. Even a local Santal teacher disparagingly commented about migrant women domestic workers: 'Educated people only go for "standard" jobs, these girls have money and modern clothes, but no education'. The Hindus avoid migration; movement to a foreign land is likely to result in a loss of caste and status (as in the case of Sheila's brother) and might result in engagement with unsuitable activities. Exceptions of course are those who migrate to white-collar jobs in the government or public sector.

e) Risks and Vulnerabilities for Households Who Stay Behind

Several attempts have been made to analyse the impact of migration not only on those who move, but also those who stay behind (Kothari 2002). While the inability to migrate is often seen as a loss of opportunity in terms of mobility, enhancing the gaps between those who migrate and those who stay put, it also leads to changes in the level of risks and vulnerabilities both at the origin and place of destination. These are gendered, but also differentiated by age and stage in the life-cycle. A majority of migrants are young and amongst women, largely unmarried. For married women, much of the migration takes place along with their husbands and families. But married men do engage in independent migration, leaving their families behind in the village, especially if they are going overseas.

I have already discussed the range of problems faced by migrants at their destination, a large proportion of these emerging from the lack of full citizenship rights in their destination. This was noted not just by overseas migrants from Bangladesh, but also Jharkhandi youth in Delhi, who lacked any proper form of identity card, hence could not avail of a range of benefits. They could not, for instance, open a bank account. In India, it is the secondary school certificate that often serves both as a birth certificate and a form of identity. Many youth do not complete their secondary schooling, in terms of passing the examination and getting the certificate, and even if they do, there are instances where an agent/middleman, promising them a job, takes away their certificates, and never returns these to them. The problem of harsh living and working conditions and ill-health has already been discussed.

Turning briefly to the position in the village home, as emerges from Table 16 below, a major aspect of migration, not often spoken about, is emotional distress, feelings of loneliness and isolation, faced not only by the migrant, but also those who stay back. In the Bangladesh context, and especially in relation to the wives of overseas migrants who only visit home once in two-three years, separation can result in a range of outcomes. Apart from income dependency and waiting for a remittance to arrive, and the stress of meeting daily needs with or without the remittance money, there is additionally, for women, the stress of their behaviour being constantly watched. The slightest slip can lead to a scandal, hence often their mobility is even more constrained, making daily survival difficult. Often, wives move to their parent's place, which they find more supportive, returning to their husband's home only when their husband is about to return. Munnaf's son-in-law is a driver in Kuwait. His daughter was facing problems in her marital home so she is now staying with them, but he is confident that once her husband returns they would have a good life. Sarvar was working in Saudi as an agricultural

labourer. His wife was staying in a joint family with her in-laws, but because he did not have a proper job and was not remitting money regularly, she was not treated well. Money had been borrowed so until he could repay the loan, she was harassed. She moved to her natal home until the loan was repaid. Sarvar then bought a mobile phone, so he could also speak occasionally to his wife (see also Sultana 2005).

Table 16: Risks and Vulnerabilities Faced by Family Members at Origin: Achingaon

Types of problem	Type of migration	
	Internal	International
Health	2 (2)	5 (12.5)
Education	3 (3)	-
Decrease in Mobility	4 (4.5)	1 (2.5)
Income Dependent	17 (19)	3 (7.5)
Increase Workload/child care	14 (15.5)	5 (12.5)
Missing partner/ parent/ loneliness	36 (40)	17 (42.5)
Emotional Stress	8 (9)	4 (10)
Wife's Dependency on Others	3 (3.5)	2 (5)
Fear of Scandal/harassment	3 (3.5)	3 (7.5)
Total	90 (100)	40 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

Children often have to be brought up single-handed, once again exposing the woman to considerable stress. The husband is not unaware of this reality and one of the major objectives of male migrants overseas is to save money to invest in a business locally, so they can stay with their family and children. Awal, an overseas migrant, said that he missed his wife and other family members and wants to come back to them as soon as possible. He does not aspire to be a rich man, but return with enough money, so he can support his family. For migrant women such as Rasheda, the separation from the family appears to be worse; she can only accept it by turning to prayer. She did not enjoy the freedom she got from her everyday work in her village home. She could not go out anywhere in Bahrain and had a lot of work to do for her employers. For her the greatest happiness and freedom lies in staying at home with her family, her husband and children.

Migrant women, however, are usually unmarried; Rasheda is an exception. Parents are constantly worried about their unmarried daughters and fearful for their marriage. Sabina's parents were criticized for sending her to work overseas. They therefore present this migration as a means to save up for a dowry. They are also trying get their daughter married before long, as the longer her absence as a migrant, the more questions are raised about her reputation, which in turn would lead to demands for a higher dowry. But herein lies an interesting gender paradox. While several of the girls mention the need to collect money for a dowry as their reason for migration, and though their monetary earnings are no doubt valuable, this process is somehow seen as 'spoiling their reputation', as inappropriate for a woman of status. They hence end up compensating for this work or loss of status through payment of higher dowries. This is expected to buy them a life of dignity, such that they need no longer go out to work.

It is interesting to note that 60 per cent of women migrants have migrated for less than three years in Achingaon, while over 65 per cent of men have migrated for more than three years (Table 17). Fear of scandal dogs the families of female migrants. Two girls from Achingaon worked in a garments factory at Nabinagar. They returned home during *Eid* (Muslim religious festival) and did not go back again. The story in the village was that they had faced sexual

harassment in the factory and perhaps also got sexually involved with someone there. Rasheda, whose daughters also work in the garments factory, said, 'It is risky for women to work outside. Girls are unsafe and anything bad can happen to them. Nobody knows when the girls will be in trouble. So it is better to marry them off soon. When these two girls came back, I too was scared about my daughters. So I got my elder daughter married; in any case she was 19 years old'.

Table 17: Duration of Migration by Sex: Achingaon

Duration of migration	Sex	
	Male	Female
Less than one year	8 (7.5)	2 (15.5)
1-3 years	31 (29)	6 (46)
3-5 years	18 (17)	3 (23)
5-7 years	12 (11)	2 (15.5)
7-9 years	9 (8.5)	-
More than 9 years	29 (27)	-
Total	107 (100)	13 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

In Katona, as already mentioned, most of the migrants, especially men, decide to stay in Delhi or other destinations, and bring their family with them. This is also true of agricultural migrants to Punjab, who travel in family groups or at least as couples. Men in the army leave their wives behind, but their salaries and perks contribute to considerably improved standards of living for their wives at home. Also, since many of these men joined the army when they were barely 15-16 years old, they are able retire with full pension and benefits by the time they are 40. Sylvester Dungdung recently retired after 20 years of service; he wanted to stay for four more years, but his wife was finding it difficult to manage the village home and agriculture. From his gratuity, they are constructing a house. He also has several fixed deposits, a motorcycle and battery-operated TV (he has even installed a solar panel to charge the battery, as there is no electric connection in the village).

From Mahari too, while a large number of migrants are single, adult males, the women left behind are often in a very difficult situation, as the earnings from migration are not high. Managing the cultivation and trying to make ends meet does enhance the physical and emotional burdens on women left behind (Karlekar 1995, Rao 2002). However, most of the men are seasonal migrants and are usually present for the cultivation of the main paddy crop during the monsoon. For many of these households, the earnings from migration are critical for survival, but as in the case of the more long-term Bangladeshi migrants, the aspiration here too is ultimately to save enough to improve agriculture or establish an alternate source of income locally in order to avoid future migrations. Migration is thus perceived as a temporary event, a result of pressures on survival, and do not really contribute to any substantial mobility, either in economic or indeed in status terms.

6. EDUCATION AND MIGRATION LINKAGES

In this final section, I pick up on a few sub-themes that link the discussion of migration to educational choices: first, does education contribute to a better deal from migration; second, does it lead to the building up of alternate networks that can reduce the dependence on caste/kin networks and open up avenues for transformation; how important really is education as a pathway to socio-economic mobility as reflected in people's remittance behaviours; and finally, what is the role of state policy in facilitating or obstructing the process of migration on the one hand and educational achievement on the other?

Educational Effect on Migration

There is a strong case made for basic education contributing to poverty reduction globally, reflected in the Millennium Development Goals. Several studies have been conducted on rates of return to education, which find this relationship to be significant. However, when one considers education as an essential 'capability' that enables one to lead a good life, with respect and dignity, and fulfill one's aspirations to the best of one's ability, then basic education may not be enough. As Jeffrey, Jeffery and Jeffery (2005: 2089) indicate in the case of northern India, 'rural people usually regard an "educated" person as someone with at least an eighth class pass and someone with just a Grade V pass as "uneducated"'. While this reflects the social perception of the value of different levels of education, Vasudeva-Dutta (2004) demonstrates the significant jump in wage earnings between secondary and higher education, suggesting that secondary education may be a threshold level for education to influence earnings (quoted in Tilak 2007).

Yet in the present study, a brief look at the regression results presented in Table 7 revealed barely any connection between educational levels and the probability of migration. It was only at higher levels of education that a significant relationship was found. To pursue this point, a further regression was run to analyse the effects of an additional year of education, both by marital status and location. The results are presented in Table 18 below.

What is interesting to note is that an additional year of schooling appears not to have any significant effect on the migration decision in general, though when this is disaggregated by location, it is significant in Sadara. The other relationships stand, being female and married is a disincentive to migrate, irrespective of levels of education. There is a positive link with age up to a certain point, after which the propensity to migrate is likely to decrease. This is very well established from the qualitative material too – men and women migrate when they are young; for women marriage is a defining moment when they stop migrating and for men as soon as they have established a sustainable livelihood.

How then can this be explained? The livelihood literature sees migration as playing a positive role in poverty reduction through diversification of livelihood strategies and spreading risk. It is seen to help people access a range of opportunities, including those not available to them locally. Education is similarly seen to play a positive role in poverty reduction through expanding one's capabilities and consequently choices. Yet, the relationship between education and migration is by no means clear, but what is discernable from the regression below is a state of flux that possibly enables social and economic mobility, and is reflected particularly in Sadara (and Katona in India), representing a 'more literate' village.

Table 18: Effect of Years of Education on Migration

	Coef Reg 1	Coef Reg2
age_yt1	.2612942*	.263296*
age_2	-.0034766*	-.0034826*
yearse~c	.0187451	
Yearseduc Sadara		.0374709*
Yearseduc Achingaon		-.0091508
Female	-1.283368*	-1.261082*
separa~d	.1522963	.1379541
Married	-.6350231*	-.6264584*
Loan	-.5163902**	-.5468787**
Expend	-.0000225**	-.0000231**
Socsec	-.5697416	-.5544281
Farir	.3731539*	.6594621*
Constant	-4.567288*	-4.761354*

Number of obs = 1221
LR chi2(14) = 314.33
Prob > chi2 = 0.0000
Log likelihood = -388.92665
Pseudo R2 = 0.2878

Achingaon and Mahari fit into a more traditional, structuralist paradigm of social inequality and segmented labour markets. As Nugent and Swaminathan (2006) illustrate in the case of Indonesia, in situations of greater inequality in general, household investments in education are likely to be lower due to lack of school infrastructure and provisioning on the one hand (the rich can go to the private schools), but also due to depressed wage rates which lowers incentives for investment in higher levels of education. Segmented labour markets make it difficult for the poor to break into a different labour market, offering higher returns. Further, for poor people, choices may also be limited – an education that seems to be providing few skills may be perceived as worthless! As Sunil Murmu of Mahari poignantly pointed out, 'It would have been better if I hadn't studied, as it would have been easier to accept the exploitation and hard work. Having been to secondary school, I found this really difficult, but had no choice'.

It would be worth exploring this proposition and the linkage, if any, between education and migration, using the data from the two sets of villages: one less literate and the other more. What is very interesting in Tables 19 and 20 below is the clear gradation visible in terms of occupational engagement, both migrant and non-migrant, by different levels of education. There is a clustering of those involved in agriculture at lower educational levels. The few exceptions are landed men, who may have had other employment in their youth, but post-retirement are managing their land. As noted by Monir, a tailor in Sadara, 'My elder brother completed grade eight from Sadara high school and worked in Katchpur for 30 years. Now he is retired and looking after his arable land. He sometimes goes to the field to supervise the labour.'

Those involved in rural non-farm work and business, both self-employment and work in factories, are concentrated in the middle levels of education. There is a clustering of wage workers around the secondary level and above, but this data is somewhat contaminated by definitional issues. Most overseas migrants engaged in a range of farm and non-farm manual work have been counted as waged workers – they are paid a monthly remuneration and the nature of their work is not really known or spoken about. Their educational levels are in the

range of junior secondary classes, a point confirmed by the study conducted by Murshid, Iqbal and Ahmed (2002). But white collar workers, those involved in teaching or other public/NGO employment are in fact those with higher levels of education.

Table 19: Education and Occupation of Migrants in Bangladeshi Villages

	Agriculture		Non-farm work		Professionals	
	M	F	M	F	M	F
Illiterate	-	-	-	-	5 (5.5)	-
Primary	8 (61.5)	-	42 (49)	7 (58)	20 (22.5)	1 (50)
Jr Second	3 (23)	-	17 (20)	3 (25)	16 (18)	-
Secondary	2 (15.5)	-	16 (19)	2 (17)	18 (20)	-
Higher	-	-	10 (12)	-	30 (34)	1 (50)
Total	13 (100)	0	85 (100)	12 (100)	89 (100)	2 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages

If one now examines the data in some detail, the segmentation of the labour market is visible, especially in Achingaon, by gender, activity and educational level. Most of the women, irrespective of educational level, are classified as home-workers. It is this status that is seen to bring prestige to them and their spouses. Agriculture and artisanal work does not require much education; it is also the most poorly paid, as reflected in several interviews. The issue of low returns to agriculture, in turn leading to low social status was clearly articulated by Khalek in Achingaon: 'I passed HSC and was a freedom fighter. I got a job in the air force but my father did not allow me to join, as I was his only son. All of my friends are well off now and they have three or four buildings each in Dhaka city. They also have private cars. I too could have been well off, but I have been working in agriculture for 30 years and have none of this'.

Rural non-farm work and business appear divided between those with very little education and those with up to secondary schooling. This is because there is a huge range of activities within this category requiring different levels of skills. If we take the example of business, we find several people with very low levels of literacy running shops in the village market. They know their customers, all local villagers, and get their children to help them with some basic accounts after school. Setting up a business in town requires more education – the scale of enterprise is likely to be larger, it is also riskier. Anowar from Achingaon said: 'I have been doing cloth/fabric business for five years in Kalampur market with my father. He was one of four persons from Achingaon to have passed grade ten. I too finished my secondary education from Suapur high school before joining the business. I invested 120,000 taka in this business. But it is risky, the fabric from my shop has already been stolen twice' (Anowar, 28, male, SSC, businessman). Setting up a business in Dhaka is one step higher -- apart from education and financial resources, it additionally requires strong networks with people who can facilitate this process. In speaking of his brother, Habib, a businessman from Sadara, said, 'My third brother passed SSC from Comilla Government College. He then went to Dhaka in search of a job. He stayed in Dhaka for three years and during this period he made some friends. He started a rice business with them. It is located in Badda in Dhaka and seems to be doing well'.

Table 20: Education and Occupation in Bangladeshi Villages

Occupation	Achingaon			Sadara			
	<=Primar	> Prim & <=Secon	Higher	<=Primary	> Prim & <=Secon	Higher	Total
Agriculture	48 (13)	16 (9)	3 (8)	46 (17)	23 (10)	7 (11)	143
Artisan	10 (2.5)	5 (3)	0	6 (2.5)	11 (5)	0	32
Rural non-farm	21 (6)	52 (30)	2 (5)	6 (2.5)	4 (2)	10 (15.5)	95
Business	20 (5.5)	14 (8)	4 (10.5)	14 (5)	30 (13.5)	8 (12)	90
Professional	0	3 (1.5)	19 (50)	35 (13)	43 (19)	25 (38.5)	125
Home workers	183 (50)	42 (24)	0	123 (46)	73 (33)	9 (14)	430
Not in labour force	83 (23)	43 (24.5)	10 (26.5)	37 (14)	39 (17.5)	6 (9)	218
Total	365 (100)	175 (100)	38 (100)	267 (100)	223 (100)	65 (100)	1133

Figures in brackets are percentages

Salaried work in Achingaon is restricted to teaching in madrasas and religious work by men, all of whom have acquired higher education in the madrasa line, some completing even the equivalent of a Master's degree (kamil) in religious education. One of them, Hashem, said: 'I went to Dautia madrasa in 1976 and studied up to SSC level. I then went to Dhamrai Depasay madrasa for two years, followed by a final two year course called "jalal ain sharif" in Dhaka. Then from 1988 to 1991 I studied further up to "daora hadis". I started my first job as a madrasa teacher in October 1991 in Gazipur, and still work there. I do the additional job of an imam in the adjoining mosque. At first, I received 300 taka and now get 1200 taka salary from the mosque. From the madrasa, I first received 800 taka, now increased to 1363 taka per month. Food and accommodation is free'. Like Hashem, having secured a madrasa education, several other young men too are working as madrasa teachers and imams.

While people aspire to work in the service sector, this sector not expanding adequately; the major growth in Bangladesh has been in the manufacturing sector, in particular the garment industry. Between 1989-90 and 2003-4, it grew by almost 9 times, attracting a large number of women workers, a majority as temporary and casual workers despite several years in the industry. Unlike salaried work, work in factories does not enhance women's status – indeed, they are seen as poor women, desperate for survival, and interviews with several showed that they did not see work in the garment industry as a career, but as a temporary route to alleviate their poverty and meet current expenditures. The non-insistence of the garment industry on a school certificate beyond the primary level has meant that many young girls, despite the possibility of securing state support through a secondary school stipend, do not complete secondary education. They prefer to work for a few years and then get married. Perhaps they have no other option as the government stipend is insufficient if they seriously want to pay all the charges and complete their secondary education.

A similar segregation is visible in Mahari, where additionally there is a division by ethnicity (Table 21). There are relatively few salaried migrants; most of them have jobs locally as teachers and para-teachers. There is also a post master and a security guard for the NTPC railway line. None of them belong to the ST category. Business and enterprise is dominated by the Hindu groups, and Muslims engage in petty trade. A majority of the Santals are engaged in farming and migrant labour, and the lower caste Hindus are also in labouring tasks, working for the better-off Hindus in the village, or selling coal in the local markets.

Table 21: Education and Occupation of Migrants in Indian Villages

	Agriculture		Other labour		Factory		Professional (army, govern't, private, religious)		Domestic work	
	K	M	K	M	K	M	K	M	K	M
Illiterate	7 (29)	34 (71)	6 (40)	7 (46.7)	1 (14)	3 (27)	-	-	10 (50)	7 (78)
Primary	7 (29)	7 (14.5)	5 (33.4)	5 (33.3)	-	5 (45)	1 (2.5)	1 (50)	7 (35)	1 (11)
Jr Second	3 (13)	4 (8.5)	2 (13.3)	2 (13.3)	2 (29)	2 (18)	5 (13)	-	2 (10)	1 (11)
Secondary	7 (29)	3 (6)	2 (13.3)	1 (6.7)	4 (57)	-	20 (51)	1 (50)	1 (5)	-
Higher	-	-	-	-	-	1 (9)	13 (33.5)	-	-	-
Total	24 (100)	48 (100)	15 (100)	15 (100)	7 (100)	11 (100)	39 (100)	2 (100)	20 (100)	9 (100)

Figures in brackets are percentages.

A few Santals have invested in education, such as Manuel Murmu, but it has been hard finding a job. Manuel's father died of cancer when he was 10 years old. He was studying in a mission school and somehow convinced his mother to let him continue. He completed his graduation in 2002, managing to help with the cultivation at home alongside his studies. Thereafter he got a job in a mission school. The salary was not much, but suddenly it shut down due to the disappearance of the pastor in-charge. He has applied several times for jobs in the railways and for teaching, but it is expensive to take so many exams and even if he clears them, often money has to be paid to secure the job. In 2006 he was appointed helper in a new school set up in the Santal hamlet under the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, though, ironically, he is more qualified than the teacher in-charge, Dev Narain, a Hindu from the same village. The meagre salary of Rs 2000 per month is hardly enough for running the household.

The lack of jobs and the difficulties in securing a job appear to be a disincentive for educational investments. As Manto noted, 'It is de-motivating to study in this village. Boys with MA/MSc degrees are getting jobs as para-teachers, earning Rs 1000-2000 per month. And they are the lucky ones; others are just sitting idle at home wondering what the point was of studying so much.' Salim added, 'People have double MAs and no work. You have to pay for work here. If you have no contacts, there are no jobs for you here'.

What then are the jobs available? Sunil Murmu had been studying in grade 9 in the Mundli mission school. He fell ill and was withdrawn for a year. Due to medical and other expenses, his parents could not afford to send him back to the same school. He went for a few months to the High School at Borio, but there was no teaching there, so ultimately he dropped out before completing his secondary education. He decided to take a risk, went to Muzaffarnagar town in Uttar Pradesh, took a rickshaw for hire and started driving it there. The earnings were not bad, but unused to the task, he developed breathlessness and could not continue. He went on to Shamli, where other boys were working in the sugarcane fields, and started work there. He earned some money, but the work was hard and he was unhappy that despite his education he could do no better.

Sunil's story highlights another point -- not just the credentials, but also the quality of education matters. This is a major issue in Mahari and was repeatedly brought up in interviews with all ethnic groups. In fact, education-related migration is an important stream of movement, as the local provision is perceived as useless. Apart from four boys in higher education, 19 children, 9 boys and 10 girls were boarding in mission schools and 15 (11 boys and 4 girls) in madrasas. Sheila, a Hindu working as an anganwadi worker, has three children –' a son and two daughters. She was vociferous in her argument for sending the children out of the village for their education, 'My son is going to the Torai Mission School, close to Pakur, where my sister lives. The studies are much better than in this government school. English is not taught here, there is no discipline and teachers show no interest in the students'. Sharif Ansari, a 25-year-old Muslim teacher, studied in a madrasa in Patna. He commented, 'Many Santal and Muslim boys are leaving the village for schooling purposes. They have the mission schools and we have our madrasas. It is better for boys to go and live where there are good schools; they can study properly and do much better. My brother is now studying in a madrasa in Delhi. Maybe he will settle there. Nobody likes to send their children away, but the state of schools is so poor here, what will he stay here and do?'

While parents are often blamed for their ignorance and for not sending their children to school, there is a different version that emerges from the narratives above. Schools are unable to attract children and hold their interest. There is very little teaching that goes on, but what is taught is largely irrelevant to the lives of the local children. As Sunil said, nothing was happening in the high school, no practical skills were taught even at that level, and he had no option but to migrate to the sugarcane fields. The mission schools are better, but not everyone can afford to send their children there. It can cost anything between Rs 4,000 and Rs 7,000 per year. Even if fees were waived in some instances, families would still have to provide for the food and boarding of their child. A key question then relates to the quality of education – what type of education is being provided and what purpose does it serve? The universal basic education being provided by the state is apparently not really influencing the options available for children – hierarchies of class and ethnicity mediate access to education and jobs, perpetuating and even intensifying social inequalities over generations.

This aspect of quality emerges quite strongly from both Sadara and Katona. The Sadara high school, though a government-run school, has an excellent track record in the district – it has secured 48 merit scholarships for its students since independence. The Katona secondary school run by the Holy Cross Sisters has been operational since 1985, though it has not yet secured government recognition. This has meant that students cannot take their secondary school certificate exam in the village, but have to register in either the government or mission high school in Simdega for this purpose. While a few do drop out, this has not been a major barrier for completion of secondary schooling.

While overseas migration from Sadara to the Middle East is an exception of sorts, essentially involving manual work, other forms of migration from both Sadara and Katona involve a search for better jobs. Dropping out of school here is not merely because of poverty or not 'valuing' education, but rather in relation to schooling quality and learning outcomes. For men, joining the army has been one reason for dropping out of school – recruitments were often done when they were in junior secondary/secondary school – and if selected, they had no compulsions about continuing their education. The army offered them a secure future. Sylvester Dungdung, for instance, joined the army when studying in grade 8. He has recently retired, has a pension and is constructing a house. As evident from Table 21, while agricultural labour and construction continue to be options for migrant workers, a large number prefer salaried work,

be it in the army, in teaching, in government or private employment or in the mission stations. A new trend is the search for factory jobs in Delhi. For all these preferred options, secondary schooling is essential; hence the aspiration does drive children to complete secondary education.

In Sadara, after passing secondary and higher secondary levels from the general stream, several people, both men and women, have secured formal employment. Pervin, 40-years-old, and her husband are both teachers in the primary and secondary school respectively. Pervin passed the SSC examination in 1984 from the Sadara high school. She completed the Certificate in Education course from the Primary Training Institute at Chandpur, Comilla district. She got this job in 1987 and has been working here for the last 19 years. Her husband left madrasa education after passing dakhil as he thought madrasa education was not 'modern'. He then passed his higher secondary examination and completed a Bachelor's degree, and has since been teaching in the high school. While Pervin and her husband both found employment in the village itself, she describes her brother thus: 'My brother is a diploma engineer. He has been working in Dhaka in the Water Supply Authority (WASA) as a sub-assistant engineer. He studied at the Sadara high school, then enrolled in the Comilla Polytechnic College. Another brother too, after completing his education from Sadara and then Hasanpur College, Daudkandi, is now working at WASA in Dhaka'. Rajon works in a printing press in Dhaka and Kabil with an NGO.

Girls too carry this aspiration, though employment options for them are more limited. Prabha Barla dropped out of school and ran away to Delhi when she failed her secondary school examination. She got a job as a domestic worker. She wanted to resume her education in a year, but her mother died and she was unable to do so, for as the eldest child, she had to earn to support her younger siblings. She has continued as a domestic worker for the last six years. She would like to get married and settle down, but perhaps stay on in Delhi, as she feels that this way she would be able to help her family better. Her employers have suggested that she complete her SSC exam in Delhi, and then apply for an 'office' job. She is keen, but does not find time to study. Sangeeta completed her high school and decided to become a nun. She stayed in the nunnery for six months, undergoing training, but was miserable; she did not like the schedule of study, prayer and work, so returned home. In the earlier generation, with her qualifications, it would have been easy to find a job, as there were fewer educated people then. This is no longer the case. She is seriously considering moving to Delhi for domestic work, even though this is not an ideal option and she realizes it. Alternately, she would need to take some further training to get a job as a teacher.

The regression showed no clear link with education, but this seems linked to both the quality of schooling and the availability of employment opportunities. Achingaon and Mahari have poor quality schooling. These are remote villages with poor infrastructure and services, and employment opportunities are minimal. Most people, with or without education, end up migrating for manual work. In Sadara and Katona, the situation is more complex. Education is of a better quality and while not always leading to better employment opportunities (a large number from here too migrate for manual work), the aspiration is strong.

Education is a strategy for skill-formation. Decisions about education vary, as aspirations for children change fast, with the opening of new opportunities, new information and new experiences. The potential for future migration opportunities does contribute towards determining what sort of education the child gets at present – does he/she continue schooling or move into some vocational skill for which there is likely to be a demand. The predictions

become important as clearly there is a gestation period for the results of education decisions to be realised. What seems clear however is that secondary education is a critical threshold towards opening up the possibilities for fulfilling such aspirations, especially for women.

Education and Social Networks

Education is closely linked to the social networks and contacts one forms across social classes. At the lower end of the labour market, as mentioned earlier, it is kinship/caste/ethnicity that seems to influence social networks from the perspective of migration and employment. Most jobs in factories, for instance, are secured through referrals. As one moves up the hierarchy, the need for other types of non-caste/kin based networks is felt -- people with influence in the bureaucracy, for instance. Such contacts are often made through the educational process.

Luke, Munshi and Rosenzweig (2003) note that 33 per cent English-schooled women and 30 per cent of the men as opposed to 10 per cent Marathi-schooled women and 9 per cent men in Mumbai were marrying outside their caste, reflecting not just a lower dependence on caste networks for obtaining jobs, but also the possibility of renegotiating gendered community rules and norms as a result of women's migration, employment and education. Such trends are however not yet visible in the study sites, at least in terms of marriage patterns. There are hints that women garment workers do often tend to choose their own marriage partner in Bangladesh, or women domestic workers from Jharkhand in Delhi. But despite some degree of freedom in terms of marital choice, this does not necessarily reduce their dependence on caste/kin networks for obtaining jobs. Pervin's three brothers are all employed in WASA. While they are all educated, this is not a coincidence; referrals appear to have worked even in securing public employment. Several narratives from Mahari too illustrate that education alone is not enough for securing jobs even in the salaried sector. As Manuel found out, both money to pay bribes and social contacts are essential in addition to academic qualifications. If competition were free and fair, and jobs could be secured purely on merit, then education is indeed likely to free people from excessive dependence on traditional networks. As of now, however, one has generally found those migrating with the support of close family and relatives having a better migration experience than those pursuing independent migration through agents, brokers or through information gained through advertisements or word of mouth.

It is only Katona that seems to be moving in the direction of breaking out of kin/ethnic networks, and here this seems to be a result not of education per se, but of the alternate social network provided by the Roman Catholic Church. For domestic workers in Delhi, for instance, even if they have not followed a relative or friend, they can seek support from the Domestic Workers' Welfare Society run by the sisters; the same is true for the nuns. As Asrita said, 'We get a holiday on Sunday between 12 and 5 pm and we go to the sisters for a meeting. Other girls come there too. There are more than a thousand girls in that area, so I do not feel lonely, even though I do not meet friends from this village. The sisters talk to all of us and teach us to deal with life here'. So while the evidence is clearly not widespread, nor sufficient to make a firm conclusion, it is interesting to note that, like the Mumbai study, it is women who are better able to build and engage with alternative networks than men. This is perhaps because, as in Mumbai, the labour markets opening up for women are relatively new, and not as strongly networked as the male labour markets.

Investment in Education

While none of the migrants dispute the importance of education, very few in fact do end up investing substantial amounts of money in the education of their children or siblings -- less than five per cent in the Bangladesh villages. Relatively more is spent on consumer durables, building assets and investing in business. While the latter two are linked to future livelihood security, they all carry within them particular status connotations. As mentioned earlier, in Bangladesh, people, especially men, increasingly aspire to an element of freedom in the work they do, and this is closely tied in to the ability to set up a business enterprise of their own. There are classifications within this too, with the village shop at the bottom end and an enterprise in the closest market town or even in the capital city demonstrating much greater levels of entrepreneurial skills and in turn status. Consumer durables and the construction of a house are a material and visible reflection of the standard of living. When taken together, these investments help individuals and households move out of particular class categories. They appear to provide an alternative route to social mobility, earlier the domain of the educated. In line with Bourdieu, while the commercial classes may lack cultural capital, their ability to gain economic capital and the social process or trajectory that is pursued for this purpose, can lead them to adopt particular types of language, culture and lifestyle that is closer to salaried professions than the working classes. Of course, culture itself is not static, with mass culture and mass media gradually taking over the cultural domain from the more exclusive forms of art and aesthetics.

In India, the perception that salaried jobs contribute to greater social respect and mobility perhaps persists to a larger extent than in Bangladesh. This could also be a result of the current scenario, where the remittances produced from migrant work are barely enough to fulfill subsistence requirements, only rarely contributing to accumulation. In fact, this is perhaps one reason that several people, especially boys in Mahari, migrate for education. Amongst Muslims and Santals, this seems to the only way to break out of the Hindu-dominated local social hierarchy. Remittances are small and do not necessarily contribute to such educational investment, yet other sources such as agricultural surpluses or support from kin or religious networks are sought for this purpose. Despite the frustration of not finding jobs, education here still remains the strategy for breaking out of particular class and social categories. As a para-teacher, even with a low salary, the perception is that people like Manuel Murmu can build contacts with local bureaucracies and enhance their chances for a better future. It also enhances social interaction, at least with his Hindu co-teacher, on a somewhat more equal plane.

Role of State Policies

State policies are varied. They relate to the social sectors (education and health), social protection (food security, pensions), employment promotion policies (infrastructure development including transport, communication and banking services) and labour legislation. Both countries reveal a multitude of schemes, policies and legislation, some more successful than others, and some in direct contradiction with others. While a detailed analysis of the range of state policies, and the synergies and contradictions therein, has not been possible as part of this study, a few examples have been studied to provide insights into how state policies and interventions can facilitate or hinder the migration process.

In both India and Bangladesh it is apparent that there has been a great push towards universalizing education provision, the argument often couched in efficiency terms, that is,

building human capital that can compete in global markets. The association with migration and competitive labour markets is obvious. In both places, scholarships are provided to the deprived, be they the poor, ethnic minorities, or girls, to pursue their education. While access to schooling has been expanded at the primary and upper primary (junior secondary) levels, the policy providing for scholarships and stipends till the secondary level seems to acknowledge the critical importance of secondary education as a threshold in terms of negotiating decent work conditions, especially for girls. Yet in a context of high poverty, as in Achingaon and Mahari, the uptake of scholarships at the secondary level is poor. There are several reasons for this: the quality of provision is poor, the stipends are insufficient to cover all costs, the curriculum is irrelevant, but also important is the trade-off made in terms of future work possibilities, locally or as migrants. Education in terms of schooling appears to provide lower pay-offs within a given time horizon in relation to apprenticeship training and migration.

To give a specific example, girls from poor households in Achingaon often withdraw from school to work in the garment industry. As already mentioned, the main expansion of female labour has been in unskilled and semi-skilled work in the readymade garments industry. This does not demand high levels of education, though does require some minimum levels of literacy. As a knitwear factory owner commented, 'One of the reasons for preferring women workers is that they work harder and do not participate in union activity' (Interview, 25/3/07). Earlier the minimum requirement for securing work was an 8th class pass certificate, but with growing demand for labour, this has been relaxed. This is confirmed by Rasheda, who said, 'While earlier factory jobs needed a class 8 certificate, this is no longer required. Anyway since both my daughters went to school for a few years, we could get the certificates easily'. The President of Karmojibi Nari, a workers' organization, bemoaned the low levels of literacy of most of the women workers: 'To participate creatively, women need to be literate and they need to be aware. Even though a majority have officially passed grade 5, they cannot actually read and write. One needs to improve the quality of education to provide meaningful learning to these girls and boys' (Interview, 24/3/07).

Interestingly, female workers did realise that better educational levels were important for promotions within the industry, as pointed out by Shamme earlier. Analysis by Chaudhury and Paul (1996: 51-2, quoted in Afsar 2001): 128) shows that education beyond primary level, skills and experience are the most important factors affecting gender difference in earnings. Better education could thus help to break the growing gender segregation of tasks on account of technological innovations, and along with targeted skill development, could help women gain access to the more remunerative jobs in the industry (Bhattacharya and Rahman 2001: 246). In fact, this strategy is being adopted by men, who now constitute over 30 per cent of the workers in the garment industry (65 per cent of workers in the knitwear industries) and are concentrated in the better paid cutting and finishing sections, as support staff and in the management. Yet, rather than investing in education and possibly better careers for their daughters, the reverse seems to be happening. They work for short durations of time, under increasing parental control, to collect money for dowries or just household consumption, the ultimate objective being to find a 'good' groom. And for boys, as already noted earlier, apprenticeship training to pick up a useful skill as well as make contacts in Dhaka city seem to be preferable to continuing with schooling, as these appear to connect better with the possibilities of overseas migration offering better returns.

So while state support to and investment in education is high, take-up is poor. The labour and employment policies clearly seem to be in contradiction. While child labour legislation does exist, over 50 per cent of the female garment workers are below the age of 18 (Paul-Majumder

and Begum 2006, Farah 2007). While the State benefits in terms of export earnings, there is no implementation of labour legislation in relation to conditions of work, wages or age of employment. Rasheda's younger daughter started work when she finished grade 5, hardly 13 years old. While the State then has invested in education and employment promotional policies, it has ignored, perhaps intentionally, the implementation of labour legislation, or the provision of minimum social benefits. The general policy environment seeks to increase and encourage employment and productive work, albeit of a less skilled workforce, rather than to provide social security to poor households to enable their children to complete their educational cycle. Quality issues and the nature of providers remain another outstanding question, which however I have not explored in this paper.

A similar story emerges in relation to female migrants from Mahari. Most of the girls who went to Delhi for the first time for domestic work were hardly 13-14 years old. They received no protection and no security of employment, despite the fact that in 2006 the government extended the provisions of the Child Labour Act to include domestic work. In the case of boys, the attitude is somewhat more discerning. Parents seem to realize that without education, they will not really have successful migrant careers. But here one finds them much more discerning in relation to quality. The discourse of poor quality of the village school is almost universal, cutting across religious and ethnic boundaries; hence if anyone is serious about education, they have to invest in sending their children to a range of private providers. It should not then come as a surprise when the Government of India reports that demand at upper primary and secondary levels has virtually been met (personal communication from R. Govinda, 12/11/07, Oxford). There is clearly no demand for state provision!

One sees the same contradictions here in terms of employment and education policies. Despite excellent labour legislation, these are rarely implemented. The focus has shifted to productivity and effort, and poverty is increasingly constructed as being a result of individual failings such as laziness and lack of enterprise, rather than genuine structural constraints. This also explains why the focus on social protection has declined over the last decade, while there has been an increase of spending on infrastructure. Subsidised food is rarely accessible to the poor despite the possession of ration cards. Pensions for widows and old people are limited and hardly in line with the local demography. While only 30 per cent of the population may be below the official poverty line, over 50 per cent suffer from chronic malnutrition. Migration itself becomes a form of social protection for them, though often with adverse health impacts.

7. CONCLUSION

What is clear from the foregoing analysis is that migration, and formal education, have different meanings in different contexts. These meanings are built around the different kinds of movements – who is moving and why -- and this is fairly distinct in the four sites. In Mahari the major migration stream remains one that is mainly male and engaged in agricultural labour (especially sugarcane cultivation) in other rural sites and for this task formal schooling seems irrelevant. Yet education remains an aspiration as it is seen as virtually the only way out of manual work to status-enhancing white-collar work. Interestingly, while ST women are fully engaged in productive agricultural work, they are somewhat missing from these new migration streams, though they continue to manage the fields at home. This migration stream, mainly driven by the need to survive, does not seem to have substantively changed gender relations locally, except for having increased the work burden on women at home during the several months when the men are away. Managed largely through social networks, the earnings from such migration remain low.

While Achingaon is similarly poor, the opening up of opportunities for overseas migration has somewhat shifted aspirations away from formal schooling to investment in consumption and other markers of status. Learning practical skills through apprenticeship, rather than formal schooling, is seen to facilitate the process of overseas migration. Religious education however is still sought here, especially for girls, though its implications for gender relations are still unclear. Research in India has indicated that material prosperity has often led to adverse gender outcomes in terms of increasing demands for dowry as well as, more recently, sex-selective abortions. In Bangladesh, the prevalence of dowry is widely visible as are signs of increasing restrictions on women's mobility even in rural areas. While overseas migration, especially to the Middle East, can potentially bring in conservative gender norms, at present, persistent poverty still drives many women to work, especially in the garment factories in Dhaka and its outskirts. While bringing in earnings, such employment for women is not viewed as desirable or status-giving and the aspiration is for women to quit such work and get married as soon as they have some money.

Katona and Sadara present a somewhat different story. Both have historically had access to better quality education, and hence there are a larger number of both, educated men and women, in these villages. Education has helped the people in Sadara gain access to a range of white-collar jobs in the state sector, in particular in teaching. Some have gone overseas, but have shown a preference for South East Asia rather than the Middle East. Incomes are higher, though investments too are more. Both the higher levels of education and exposure to more gender equitable cultures have meant that liberal ideas still persist in Sadara to a large extent. And an almost equal number of girls as boys are pursuing higher education outside the village.

For the young people in Katona, it has been more difficult to get jobs, as their education has often been insufficient to help them overcome the negative social stereotyping that they face as Scheduled Tribes in India. Some of the men have entered the army, but a majority has found factory work or other private sector jobs in Delhi or other large cities. A large number of women have gone into domestic work, but for those seeking salaried jobs, often the only route has been through joining a missionary institution. For many young women, becoming a nun is a practical option – while there might be personal sacrifices to be made, there are gains in terms of future security as well as opportunities for higher education and better work. The trade-off often seems worthwhile.

Migration then does not just have different meanings in different contexts, but its implications for both educational choices and gender relations are likely to vary depending on the nature of migration and the opportunities it offers for social mobility. Given the difficulties faced during the migration process, women in both countries, though more particularly in Bangladesh, reveal a preference for marriage as the source of security and stability, rather than careers, except for white-collar careers as in teaching. But even here, the location of work and its duration is shaped by the circumstances of marriage and the needs of the marital family. In most other cases, a working wife is seen to reflect badly on the husband's ability to provide, and every effort is made to ensure that she can give up her job. Parents of poor girls are increasingly seeking overseas migrant grooms for their daughters in the hope that the higher earnings this brings would give their daughters a life of comfort and security.

I would like to end with a reminder that inequalities exist -- in fact they appear to be deepening in south Asia. While land to some extent has been replaced by money as a marker of status and wealth, the real struggle appears to be in terms of the quality of labour. In a globalizing world, the demand for cheap labour is growing. While the labour may be educated to different degrees, they are labeled as unskilled, and their skills are devalued in the context of migration, with the result that the motivation for pursuing further education declines. The more educated as in Katona and Sadara are increasingly unwilling to engage with low paid jobs, as education seems to result in a shift in terms of aspirations and status-markers. States then do face a trade off in the short term in terms of providing cheap labour for global capital that can enhance growth rates or then engaging in a much slower and longer term process of human capital development. State policies do seem to reflect these tensions. While migration is largely supported, more by default, rather than intention (opening up communication rather than implementing labour laws or social protection), the educational scenario is much more ambiguous. While there is commitment to enhancing access to basic education, there is hardly any attention to the quality of skills these provide or indeed to higher levels of training.

REFERENCES

Afsar, R. (2001) 'Sociological Implications of Female Labour Migration in Bangladesh', in Sobhan, R. and Khundker, N., *Globalisation and Gender: Changing Pattern of Women's Employment in Bangladesh,* Dhaka: Centre for Policy Dialogue and University Press Limited: 91-166.

Afsar, R., M. Yunus, A B M. Shamsul Islam (2002) *Are Migrants Chasing after the "Golden Deer"? A Study on Cost-Benefit Analysis of Overseas Migration by the Bangladeshi Labour*, Dhaka: International Organisation for Migration (IOM) Regional Office for South Asia.

Aftabuddin, M. (2006) *Perceptions, Motivations, Learning and Uses of Literacies in Relation to Livelihoods: a Case Study of Two Bangladeshi Villages*, PhD Thesis, Nottingham: Department of Education - University of Nottingham.

Ahmed, M., Ahmed, K. S., Khan, N.I and Ahmed, R (2007) *Access to Education in Bangladesh: Country Analytic Review of Primary and Secondary Education*, Dhaka: Institute of Educational Development - BRAC University.

Appadurai, A. (1996) *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalisation*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Balagopalan, S. (2005) 'An Ideal School and the Schooled Ideal: Education at the Margins', in R. Chopra and P. Jeffery, *Educational Regimes in Contemporary India.* New Delhi: Sage Publications: 83-98.

Bhattacharya, D. and Rahman, N. (2001) 'Prospects for Internalising Global Opportunities in the Apparel Sector in Bangladesh', in Sobhan, R. and Khundker, N., *Globalisation and Gender: Changing Pattern of Women's Employment in Bangladesh,* Dhaka: Centre for Policy Dialogue and University Press Limited: 219-267.

Blanden, J., Gregg, P. and Machin, S. (2005) *Intergenerational Mobility in Europe and North America,* London: Sutton Trust.

Bourdieu, P. (1984) *Distinction*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Bowles, S., Gintis, H. and Groves, M. O. (eds) (2005) *Unequal Chances: Family Background and Economic Success*, New York and Princeton: Russell Sage Foundation and Princeton University Press.

Chatterjee, P (2004) Politics of the Governed: Reflections on Popular Politics in Most of the World. New York. Columbia University Press.

Chavan, P. and Bedamatta, R. (2006) 'Trends in Agricultural Wages in India: 1964-65 to 1999-2000' in *Economic and Political Weekly,* 41(38): 4041-51.

Chin, C. (1998) *In Service and Servitude: Foreign domestic workers and the Malaysian "Modernity Project"*, New York: Columbia University Press.

Corbett, M. (2005) 'Rural Education and Out-migration: The Case of a Coastal Community', *Canadian Journal of Education,* 28(1&2): 52-72.

Curran, S. R. (1996) 'Intra-household Exchange Relations: Explanations for Gender Differentials in Education and Migration Outcomes in Thailand', Center for Studies in Demography and Ecology and Battelle Population Research Group, Working Paper Series 96-12. Seattle: University of Washington, WA

Curran, S. R. and A. C. Saguy (2001). 'Migration and Cultural Change: a Role for Gender and Social Networks?' *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 2(3): 54-77.

Das, M. B. and S. Desai (2003) Why are Educated Women Less Likely to be Employed in India? Testing Competing Hypotheses. Washington D.C, The World Bank.

De Haan, A. (1999) 'Livelihoods and Poverty: the Role of Migration - A Critical Review of the Migration Literature', *Journal of Development Studies*, 36(2): 1-47.

De Haas, H. (2005) *International Migration, Remittances and Development: Myths and Fact*,

Geneva: Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM).
De Neve, G. (2004) 'The Workplace and the Neighbourhood: Locating Masculinities in the South Indian Textile Industry', in Chopra, R. Osella, C. and Osella, F., *South Asian masculinities: context of change, sites of continuity,* New Delhi: Kali for Women: 60-95.
Erikson, R. and Goldthorp, J. H. (2002) 'Intergenerational Inequality: a Sociological Perspective', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 16(3): 31-44.
Estudillo, J. P., Quisumbing, A. and Otsuka, K.. (2001) 'Gender Differences in Land Inheritance, Schooling and Lifetime Income: Evidence from the Rural Philippines', *Journal of Development Studies*, 37(4): 23-48.
Farah, M. A. Q. (2007) 'Rural Intra-household Gender Relationships in Transformation: Women's and Men's Bargaining Power on Land and Money in Paipa (Colombia)' presented at the DEV Seminar Series, Norwich: School of Development Studies, University of East Anglia.
Foster, A. D. and Rosenzweig, M. (2002) 'Household Division and Rural Economic Growth' Review of Economic Studies, 69: 839-69.
Gardner, K. (2006) 'The Transnational Work of Kinship and Caring: Bengali British Marriages in Historical Perspective.' *Global Networks: A Journal of Transnational Affairs* **6**(4): 373-387.
Gardner, K. and Ahmed, Z. (2006) 'Place, Social Protection and Migration in Bangladesh: A 'Londoni' Village in Biswanath', Working Paper WP-T18, Brighton, University of Sussex: Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
Gerth, H. H. and Mills, C. W. (eds) ([1948] 1997) *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology,* London: Routledge.
GOI (2002) *Second National Commission on Labour Report*, New Delhi: Government of India.
Government of Bangladesh (2004) Statistical Pocketbook of Bangladesh. Ministry of Statistics, Dhaka.
Govinda, R. and Bandyopadhyay, M. (2007) *Access to Elementary Education in India: Country Analytic Review,* New Delhi: National University for Educational Planning and Administration.
Granovetter, M. (1973) 'The Strength of Weak Ties', *American Journal of Sociology*, 78(6): 1360-80.
Granovetter, M. (1985) 'Economic Action and Social Structure: the Problem of Embeddedness', American *Journal of Sociology*, 91(3): 481-510.
Hashim, I. (2005) 'Exploring the Linkages between Children's Independent Migration and Education: Evidence from Ghana' Working Paper WP-T12, Brighton, University of Sussex: Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
Iversen, V. (2006) 'Segmentation, Network Multipliers and Spillovers: a Theory of Rural-Urban Migration for a Traditional Economy', Working Paper WP-T9, Brighton, University of Sussex: Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
Jackson, C. (2007) 'Resolving Risk? Marriage and Creative Conjugality', *Development and Change*, 38(1): 107-29.
Jeffrey, C., Jeffery, P. and Jeffery, R. (2005) 'Reproducing Difference? Schooling, Jobs and Empowerment in Uttar Pradesh, India', *World Development,* 33(12): 2085-2101.
Jeffrey, C., Jeffery, R. and Jeffery, P. (2004) 'Degrees without Freedom: the Impact of Formal Education on Dalit Young Men in North India', *Development and Change*, 35(5): 963-986.
Karlekar, M. (1995) 'Gender Dimensions in Labour Migration: an Overview' in Schenk-Sandbergen, L., *Women and Seasonal Labour Migration,* New Delhi: Sage: 23-78.
Kibria, N. (2004) 'Returning International Labour Migrants from Bangladesh: the Experience and Effects of Deportation', Rosemarie Rogers Working Paper Series, WP No.28,

Boston, Boston University: Inter-University Committee on International Migration.
Kothari, U. (2002) 'Migration and Chronic Poverty', Working Paper No 16, Manchester: Chronic Poverty Research Centre, Institute for Development Policy and Managerment.
Kujur, J. and Jha, V. (eds) (2006) *Women Tribal Domestic Workers in Delhi: A Study of Deprivation and Migration,* New Delhi: Indian Social Institute: 200.
Kumar, K. (1993) *What Is Worth Teaching?* New Delhi: Orient Longman.
Longwe, S. (1988) 'Education for Women's Empowerment or Schooling for Women's Subordination?', *Gender and Development,* 6(2): 19-26.
_____. (1998) 'Education for Women's Empowerment or Schooling for Women's Subordination'? *Gender and Development* 6(2): 19-26.
Luke, N., Munshi, K. Rosenzweig, M. (2003) Marriage, Networks and Jobs in Third World Cities, Boston: *Journal of the European Economic Association*, 2(2–3):437–446.
Lunt, P. (1995) 'Psychological Approaches to Consumption', in Miller, D. (ed) *Acknowledging Consumption: a Review of New Studies*, London: Routledge.
Mahmud, S. (2001) 'The Labour Use of Women in Rural Bangladesh', in Sobhan, R. and Khundker, N., *Globalisation and Gender: Changing Pattern of Women's Employment in Bangladesh,* Dhaka: Centre for Policy Dialogue and University Press Limited: 25-60.
McKenzie, D. and Rapoport, H. (2007) 'Network Effects and the Dynamics of Migration and Inequality: Theory and Evidence from Mexico', *Journal of Development Economics,* 84(1): 1-24.
Miller, D. (ed) (1995) *Acknowledging Consumption: a Review of New Studies*, London: Routledge.
Mills, M. B. (1999) 'Migrant Labor Takes a Holiday: Reworking Modernity and Marginality in Contemporary Thailand', *Critique of Anthropology,* 19(1): 31-51.
Mitter, S. (1994) 'On Organising Women in Casualised Work: a Global Overview', in Rowbotham, S. and Mitter, S., *Dignity and Daily Bread,* London and New York: Routledge: 14-52.
Mosse, D., S. Gupta, Mehta, M., Shah, V, and J. Rees (1999) 'Brokered Livelihoods: Debt, Labour Migration and Development in Tribal Western India', *Journal of Development Studies,* 38(5): 59-88.
Mukta, Z. H. (2006) 'The Recent Unrest in the Garment Industry: an Evaluation Untold', Dhaka: Karmojibi Nari: 4-10.
Munshi, K. and Rosenzweig, M. (2003) *Traditional Institutions Meet the Modern World: Caste, Gender and Schooling Choice in a Globalising Economy*, Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Department of Economics.
Murshid, K. A. S., Iqbal, K.and Ahmed, M. (2002) *A Study on Remittance Flows and Utilisation*, Dhaka: International Organisation for Migration (IOM) Regional Office for South Asia.
NCEUS (2007) *Report on Conditions of Work and Promotion of Livelihoods in the Unorganised Sector*, New Delhi: National Commission for Enterprises in the Unorganised Sector, Government of India.
Nugent, J. B. and Swaminathan, S. (2006) 'Household Investments in Education and Income Inequality at the Community Level: Evidence from Indonesia', in De Janvry, A. and Kanbur, R. (eds) *Poverty, Inequality and Development: Essays in honour of Erik Thorbecke,* NJ, USA: Springer: 109-129.
Oni, B. (1988) 'Education and Alternative Avenues of Mobility: a Nigerian Study', *Comparative Education Review*, 32(1): 87-99.
Parry, J. and Bloch, M. (eds) (1989) *Money and the Morality of Exchange,* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Paul-Majumder, P. and Begum, A. (2006) *Engendering Garment Industry: The Bangladesh Context,* Dhaka: The University Press Limited.

Piketty, T. (1995) 'Social Mobility and Redistributive Politics', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 110(3): 551-84.

Portes, A. and Sensenbrennerm, J. (1993) 'Embeddedness and Immigration: Notes on the Social Determinants of Economic Action, *American Journal of Sociology,* 98(6): 1320-50.

Rana, K. and Johnson, L. T. (2003) 'The Hot Tempered Cold Fever: Illness and Impoverishment among the Adivasis of Jharkhand', *Economic and Political Weekly.*

Rana, K., Santra, S. et al. (2005) *The Pratichi Health Report,* New Delhi: Pratichi (India) Trust and TLM Books.

Rao, N. (2002) *Standing One's Ground: Gender, Land and Livelihoods in the Santal Parganas, Jharkhand, India*, PhD Thesis, Norwich: School of Development Studies, University of East Anglia.

RMMRU (2002) *Recruitment and Placement of Bangladesh Migrant Workers: An Evaluation of the Process*, Dhaka: International Organisation for Migration (IOM) Regional Office for South Asia.

Rogaly, B, Biswas, J, Coppard, D, Rafique, A, Rana, K and A Sengupta (2001) Seasonal Migration for Rural Manual Work in Eastern India. Report to ESCOR. School of Development Studies, University of East Anglia, Norwich.

Sabates-Wheeler, R., Sabates, R. and Castaldo, A. (2005) 'Tackling Poverty-Migration Linkages: Evidence from Ghana and Egypt', Working Paper WP-T14, Brighton, University of Sussex: Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.

Sachar, Rajendra (2006) Social, Economic and Educational Status of the Muslim Community of India Report. New Delhi: Government of India.

Sen, B. (2003) 'Drivers of Escape and Descent: Changing Household Fortunes in Rural Bangladesh', *World Development,* 31(3): 513-534.

Sen, K. and Stivens, M. (eds) (1998) *Gender and Power in Affluent Asia,* London and New York: Routledge.

Shah, A. (2006) 'The Labour of Love: Seasonal Migration from Jharkhand to the Brick Kilns of Other States in India', *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, 40(1): 91-118.

Shah, N. M. and Menon, I. (1999) 'Chain Migration through the Social Network: Experience of Labour Migrants in Kuwait', *International Migration,* 37(2): 361-382.

Siddiqui, T. (2003) 'Migration as a Livelihood Strategy of the Poor: The Bangladesh Case', presented at the Regional Conference on Migration, Development and Pro-Poor Policy Choices in Asia on 22–24 June 2003, Dhaka: RMMRU.

Siddiqui, T. and C. R. Abrar (2002) Contribution of Returnees: an Analytical Survey of Post-return Experience, Dhaka: International Organisation for Migration (IOM) Regional Office for South Asia.

Sultana, N. (2005) *Migrant's Wife's Life: Female Face of Migration*, Dhaka: Impact Monitoring and Evaluation Cell, Proshika.

Tete, P. (1986) *A Missionary Social Worker in India: Fr J. B. Hoffman*, Ranchi: Satya Bharathi.

Tilak, J. B. G. (2007) 'Post-elementary Education, Poverty and Development in India', International *Journal of Educational Development*, 27: 435-445.

Tolbert, C. M. et al. (1998) Local Capitalism, Civic Engagement and Socio-economic Wellbeing', *Social Forces*, 77(2): 401-27.

Turner, B. S. (1988) *Status*, Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Unni, J. and Raveendran, G. (2007) 'Growth of Employment (1993-94 to 2004-05): Illusion of Inclusiveness?', *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42(3): 196-99.

Vasudeva-Dutta, P. (2004) 'The Structure of Wages in India, 1983-1999', PRUS Working Paper no. 25, Brighton: Department of Economics, University of Sussex.

Whitehead, A. (2002) 'Tracking Livelihood Change: Theoretical, Methodological and Empirical Perspectives from North-East Ghana', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 28(3): 575-598.

Willis, P. (1977) *Learning to Labour: How Working Class Kids Get Working Class Jobs,* Farnborough, Saxon House, Teakfield Ltd.

ANNEX 1: PROFILES OF RESPONDENTS OF IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS

Achingaon

S.No.	Name	Sex	Age	Education	Occupation	Place of work	Special remarks
1	Md. Abdul Gani	Male	50	SSC	Business	Suapur and Savar	Set up hafezia madrasa
2	Hafez Md. Delwar Hossain	Male	19	Hafezia	Student	Atigram	
3	Md. Farid Ahmad	Male	23	SSC	Garment worker	Nabinagar	Overseas migration
4	Md. Monowar Hossain	Male	22	5	Welding shop	Dhaka	Grocery shop in the village
5	*Sabina*	Male	20	8	Overseas migrants	Bahrain	
6	Md. Solaiman	Male	40	Kamil	Alia madrasa teacher	Alia madrasa	Overseas migrant
7	Abu Said	Male	20	4	Labour, boatman	Village, Mirpur-dhaka	
8	Abdul Awal	Male	29	9	Overseas migration	Saudi Arabia	
9	Md. Delwar Hossain	Male	26	BA	Student/garments business	Manikganj/kalampur	
10	Rahela Begum	Female	36	Illiterate	Housework	Home compound	Daughter works garments factory
11	Rasheda	Female	37	Illiterate	Housework	Home compound	Returned overseas migrants
12	**Salma**	Female	17	10	Student	Alia madrasa	Uncles' are madrasa educated
13	Md. Zahir Uddin	Male	52	SSC	Primary school teacher	In the village	His son is educated and has a job in Dhaka
14	Abul Hasem	Male	44	Daora hadis	Imam of mosque and madrasa teacher	Gazipur	
15	Kalpana	Female	23	7	Housework	Home compound	Husband works in welding shop, attempts to move overseas
16	Md. Mannan Shikder	Male	40	Hafez	Imam	Manikganj	
17	Rahima Akter Nila	Female	20	10	Batik	Savar	Brother is a driver overseas
18	Md. Shamsul Alam	Male	55	HSC	Suffers ill-health	Home compound	Daughter works in garment factory

19	Jharna	Female	19	5	Garment worker	Nabinagar	Mother an overseas migrants
20	Basar	Male	44	8	Overseas migrant	Saudi Arabia	
21	Shahin	Male	32	7	Overseas migrant	Saudi Arabia	Brother too an overseas migrant

Sadara

S.No.	Name	Sex	Age	Education	Occupation	Occupation where	Special remarks
1	Jharna	Female	20	10	Housework	Home compound	
2	Moulvi Jaman Hussain	Male	18	Moulvi	Hafezia madrasa teacher	Kabirchandradi	Brother is overseas migrant
3	Md. Waeskorony	Male	16	HSC	Student	Gouripur Government College	Brother overseas migration (Singapore and Saudi Arabia)
4	Shahino Aktar	Female	23	9	Housework	Home compound	Husband overseas migrant
5	Helena Aktar	Female	38	9	Housework	Home compound	Retired husband, son is studying in madrasa
6	Jahanara Begum	Female	40	SSC	NGO job	In the village	Husband business man
7	Md. Mohsin Miah	Male	23	3	Shopkeeper	In the village	Father overseas migrants
9	Md. Moslem Uddin	Male	50	BA	High school teacher	In the village	Wife also teacher of GPS
10	Pervin Aktar	Female	40	SSC	Primary school teacher	In the village	Husband is teacher of high school
11	Md. Monir Hossain	Male	40	8	Tailoring shop	Village old paler bazar	
12	Md. Habibur Rahman (Baccu)	Male	49	SSC	Businessman	In the village	Both he and wife are returned migrants from south Korea
13	Shilpi	Female	22	HSC	Private sector job	Dhaka	
14	Hasina	Female	20	6	Household work	Home compound	Husband overseas migrant in Saudi Arabia
15	Monir Hossain	Male	40	Illiterate	Grocery shop owner	Old paler bazar	Son is studying in madrasa
16	Rajon	Male	23	9	Works in a press	Dhaka	

17	Zahir	Male	18	Dakhil (SSC)	Waiter	Saudi Arabia	Father also overseas migrant in Malaysia
18	Zisan	Male	20	8	Electrician	Saudi Arabia	
19	Shomser	Male	22	Illiterate	Agriculture	In village	
20	Hazrat	Male	41	Illiterate	Agriculture	In village	

Katona

S.No.	Name	Sex	Age	Education	Occupation	Place of work	Other Remarks
1.	Sylvester Dungdung	Male	40	8	Army	Different parts of India	Just retired after 20 years
2.	Praful Soreng	Male	23	9	Factory worker	In Kapashera, near Delhi	
3.	Victor Dungdung	Male	36	Intermediate	Agriculture	In village	Brothers in regular employment, but he stayed in village to look after the land
4.	Vijay Soreng	Male	28	Intermediate	Shop	In village	Unable to secure regular job
5.	Thomas Soreng	Male	60	Illiterate	Agriculture	In village	Migrant in Assam for 27 years
6.	Jon Tirkey	Male	30	Illiterate	Agricultural labour	In village and Punjab	Seasonal migrant to Punjab
7.	Jerome Dungdung	Male	28	6	Agriculture and carpentry	In village and environs	Brother migrant to Punjab for agriculture
8.	Rimon Barla	Male	46	6	Army	Different parts of India	From 1974 to 1989
9	Victoria Dungdung	Female	38	7	Domestic worker	In Delhi	Since 1986 when father ill
10	Prabha Barla	Female	23	10	Domestic worker	In Delhi	Since 1999 when failed exam
11	Natalia Kullu	Female	40	Intermediate	Private Teacher	In village	Gives tuitions, no regular job due to ill-health
12	Lily Dungdung	Female	27	MA	Teacher	Holy Cross School in village	
13	Asrita Soreng	Female	26	2	Domestic worker	In Delhi since 2003	Works through a mission-run agency
14	Meena Kumari	Female	16	Illiterate	Domestic worker	In Delhi	Returned due to ill-health

15	Dorothy Dungdung	Female	30	Illiterate	Agriculture and house work	Punjab and village	Seasonal migrant, but she stopped after birth of child
16	Kunwari Soreng	Female	40	3	Agriculture and house work	In village	Husband a mason in construction works
17	Nilima Soreng	Female	31	SSC	Tailoring	In village	
18	Pushpa kerketta	Female	40	Illiterate	Agricultural labour, sale of liquor	In village	Widow with three children
19.	Sangeeta Dongat	Female	18	illiterate	Domestic worker and brick kilns	In Delhi/village	Bad experience in Delhi has made her return and take to brick kiln work close by

Mahari

S.No.	Name	Sex	Age	Education	Occupation	Place of work	Other Remarks
1	Lakhiram Soren	Male	40	10	Agriculture and security guard for NTPC	In village	Got job in return for loss of land
2	Chunko Hembrum	Male	50	10	Contractor	Surrounding area	Also cultivates own land
3	Manuel Murmu	Male					
4	Bhaiya Besra	Male	22	Intermediate	Tuitions	In village/Borio	Trying to study further and get a job
5	Bhim Mohli	Male	35	Illiterate	Bamboo work	In village	Chairperson of school management committee
6	Majhi Tudu	Male	26	Illiterate	Agriculture	Western UP	Seasonal migrant for 8 months a year
7	Sunil Murmu	Male	25	9	Agriculture	Western UP	Seasonal migrant for 8months, trying to become an agent
8	Abdur Rauf	Male	26	BA	Teacher	In village	New primary school

9	Islam Ansari	Male	25	7	Labour agent	Moves to Delhi and UP	Provides agricultural labour in western UP
10	Kulesh Sah	Male	34	BA	Tuitions	Village	Could not get a regular job
11	Sapna Pandit	male	36	10	Selling coal	In Tinpahar and surrounding areas	Selling coal is an illegal activity, so wary of police
12	Manju Soren	Female	22	Illiterate	Domestic Worker	In Delhi	Returned without money
13	Kahan Soren	Female	20	6	Domestic worker	In Delhi	Was cheated and came with little money
14	Sunita Tudu	Female	22	10	Village health worker	In village	Poorly paid, little training
15	Sheila Thakur	Female	33	Intermediate	Balwadi worker	In village	Poorly paid
16	Manto Pandit	Male	19	10	Construction	In Delhi	Looking for work in village due to bad experience in Delhi
17	Hemlata Devi	Female	21	8	House work	In village	Husband is a parateacher and runs a grocery store
18	Sumitra devi	Female	40	3	Cook in school	In village	Husband engages in coal trade